

**APACHE COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT**

P. O. Box 238  
St. Johns, Arizona 85936  
Phone: (928) 337-7526

**PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES FOR May 6, 2026**

**Commissioners**

**District I**

Carey Dobson  
Bobby Fite  
Brad Jarvis

**District II**

Kay Hauser

**District III**

Brad Peterson, Chair  
Bob Pollock, Vice-Chair  
Travis Johnson

**Alternate**

Michael Bragiel

**Staff Members in attendance**

Matthew Fish, Director

Shanna Pearce, Project Manager

**Legal Council**

Christopher Resare, Chief Deputy Attorney

**WORK SESSION**

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Brad Peterson called the Work Session to order at 4:00 p.m. (MST) and announced that he would no longer recuse himself from renewable energy discussions unless a matter directly involved a company subject to a nondisclosure agreement related to his position on the Navopache Electric Cooperative Board of Directors. Chair Peterson also reordered the agenda to move the Renewable Energy Preferred Areas discussion later in the work session.

**Discussion Regarding a Date and Time of the Planning & Zoning Field Trip to Wind/Solar Projects in Navajo County and New Mexico**

Community Development Director Matthew Fish discussed scheduling a field trip to the West Camp Renewable Energy Project in Navajo County. Mr. Fish stated that AES representatives would be available to answer technical questions during the visit.

Approval June 3, 2026

Commissioners discussed availability and travel logistics. Commissioners agreed to schedule the field trip for Thursday, May 14, 2026, departing at approximately 9:00 a.m. Commissioners also discussed scheduling a separate future visit to a project in New Mexico if needed.

**DISCUSSION REGARDING THE NEED FOR, AND POTENTIAL SCHEDULING OF, A SPECIAL WORK SESSION TO FINALIZE THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE APACHE COUNTY RENEWABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT ORDINANCE.**

Mr. Fish discussed the need for a special work session to continue work on the Renewable Energy Ordinance amendments. Commissioners discussed scheduling and availability. Consensus was reached to hold a special work session on Tuesday, May 26, 2026 at 8:30 a.m. (MST).

**DISCUSSION REGARDING MOVING THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION WORK SESSION TO 12:00 P.M. AND THE PUBLIC MEETING TO 1:00 P.M., TO BE HELD ON THE FIRST WEDNESDAY OF EACH MONTH, EFFECTIVE JULY 2026.**

Mr. Fish reviewed the current meeting schedule and stated that staff had received feedback supporting a return to the prior noon work session and 1:00 p.m. public meeting schedule. Commissioners discussed balancing public participation with commissioner travel and scheduling considerations. Commissioners generally supported returning to the earlier schedule, while Commissioner Brad Jarvis expressed concern that later meeting times improved public participation opportunities.

Mr. Fish stated that the Commissioners could discuss further and take formal action during the public meeting.

**DISCUSSION REGARDING THE PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO GREER ARTICLE 6.**

Mr. Fish reviewed proposed amendments to Greer Article 6 related to resort-oriented uses within the Greer Commercial Resort zoning district, including condominiums, timeshares, and fractionals. Mr. Fish explained that the amendments were intended to clarify that uses within the zoning should be associated with resort lodging activities. Commissioners discussed whether additional amendments were necessary and whether there was an existing issue requiring correction. Commissioners Mike Bragiel and Bob Pollock stated they believed the existing ordinance functioned appropriately.

Commissioners discussed concerns regarding requiring meal service as part of the definition of a resort and discussed whether future redevelopment scenarios could occur within the zoning.

Approval June 3, 2026

Deputy County Attorney Chris Resare advised that the Commission could not take action during a work session. Mr. Fish stated the matter would be placed on the June agenda.

**DISCUSSION REGARDING NAMES FOR A PROPOSED SPECIAL SUB-COMMITTEE TO POSSIBLY AMEND THE ALPINE COMMUNITY PLAN.**

Mr. Fish reviewed the purpose of community plans and discussed efforts to update the Alpine Community Plan. Mr. Fish presented a proposed list of committee members representing residents, business owners, and community stakeholders.

Commissioner Bobby Fite discussed the selection process and stated efforts were made to include full-time residents, part-time residents, and business owners.

Commissioners discussed whether a Planning and Zoning Commissioner should serve on the subcommittee. Commissioner Fite expressed concern regarding a possible conflict of interest, while Chair Peterson stated he did not believe a conflict existed.

Commissioner Fite agreed to serve on the subcommittee. Commissioners directed that the matter be placed on a future agenda.

**DISCUSSION OF REPEALING ARTICLE 24 OF THE APACHE COUNTY ZONING ORDINANCE AND RESERVING THE ARTICLE NUMBER FOR FUTURE USE.**

Mr. Fish stated that Article 24 concerning overnight rentals conflicted with current state law and that the ordinance was rarely enforced. Mr. Fish recommended repeal of the article.

Commissioners discussed the lack of enforcement resources and the limited number of complaints received.

Commissioners expressed support for repealing Article 24 and placing the matter on the June agenda.

**DISCUSSION OF A MORATORIUM ON CONDITIONAL USE PERMITS FOR RENEWABLE ENERGY UNTIL THE RENEWABLE ENERGY ORDINANCE IS COMPLETE**

Chair Peterson proposed discussing a possible moratorium on renewable energy Conditional Use Permits until completion of the Renewable Energy Ordinance rewrite.

Deputy County Attorney Chris Resare advised that Arizona law permits counties to adopt moratoriums if statutory requirements are met.

Approval June 3, 2026

Commissioners discussed timelines, procedural requirements, and the need for legal review.

Mr. Fish stated staff would research available options and review actions taken by other Arizona counties.

Commissioners discussed scheduling a special meeting to further consider the matter.

**DISCUSSION OF PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO RENEWABLE ENERGY DEVELOPMENT ORDINANCE AND INCORPORATING THE PREFERRED AREAS INTO THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

Mr. Fish reviewed recent revisions to the proposed Renewable Energy Ordinance and Comprehensive Plan amendments, including scenic corridor additions and reorganization of the ordinance into a proposed Article 8.

Mr. Fish discussed revisions related to consultation language, the role of the Board of Supervisors, and comments received from members of the public.

Mr. Fish stated additional revisions would be prepared for the upcoming special work session. No additional commissioner comments were made.

**DISCUSSION ON ANY FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS.**

No discussion occurred.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Peterson adjourned the Work Session at 5:00 p.m. (MST).

**PUBLIC MEETING**

Chair Brad Peterson called the Public Meeting to order at 5:10 p.m. (MST).

**ROLL CALL**

Chairman Peterson determined a quorum was present with seven (7) members present.

**Commission Members Present:** Bobby Fite, Bob Pollock, Kay Hauser, Brad Jarvis, Carey Dobson, Mike Bragiel, and Chair Brad Peterson.

**Commission Members Absent:** Travis Johnson.

**REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF THE April 1, 2026 MINUTES**

Approval June 3, 2026

**Motion:** Commissioner Kay Hauser moved to approve the April 1, 2026 Work Session and Public Hearing Minutes. Second by Bob Pollock.

**Vote:** 7 ayes, 0 nays.

**Motion carried.**

## **PROPOSED REVISION TO THE PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION MEETING SCHEDULE**

Commissioners discussed returning the regular Work Session to 12:00 p.m. and the Public Meeting to 1:00 p.m. beginning in July 2026.

Commissioner Kay Hauser discussed the prior meeting schedule and suggested future use of virtual participation technology.

Commissioner Brad Jarvis reiterated concerns regarding public participation at earlier meeting times.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Kay Hauser moved to change the meeting schedule effective July 2026 to hold the Work Session at 12:00 p.m. (MST) and the Public Meeting at 1:00 p.m. (MST) on Wednesdays. Second by Commissioner Bobby Fite.

**VOTE:** 6 ayes, 1 nay (Commissioner Brad Jarvis).

**Motion carried**

## **SPECIAL WORK SESSION FOR RENEWABLE ENERGY ORDINANCE AMENDMENTS**

Mr. Fish stated the Commission had discussed during the work session holding a special work session on Tuesday, May 26, 2026, at 8:30 a.m.

No further discussion.

**Chair Peterson asked the question all in favor 7, all opposed 0. Motion carried.**

## **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Chair Peterson explained procedures for Call to the Public, provided two minutes per speaker, and stated he would allow speakers to yield time to others but encouraged individuals to speak directly.

**Donald Maxwell**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding ongoing drought conditions in Arizona and referenced recent reports concerning water

supply demands in the Phoenix area. Mr. Maxwell also commented on utility-scale wind energy projects and referenced reports concerning federal review or suspension of certain projects due to potential radar and national security concerns. He stated that a potential moratorium discussion by the Commission could provide additional time to address those concerns.

**Susan Maxwell**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy development standards. She expressed concerns about the proximity of wind turbines to residential communities, including potential impacts related to noise, vibration, turbine failures, lightning, fire risks, and quality of life. Ms. Maxwell recommended increasing setback distances for wind turbines and limiting projects to the proposed primary and secondary preferred energy areas discussed by the County. She also commented that the proposed noise standard of 50 decibels was too high for residential areas and schools and recommended a lower standard. In addition, Ms. Maxwell expressed concerns regarding protection of water resources and the potential effects of renewable energy development on natural resources within Apache County.

**Wayne Runge** yielded his time to Mark Seipke.

**Mike Lara**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding concerns related to drought conditions and proposed wind energy development. Mr. Lara commented on existing water supply concerns in the area and expressed concerns that large-scale wind projects, including land clearing, road construction, and turbine foundations, could affect water infiltration and increase runoff. He stated that changes to the land could have long-term impacts on local water resources and requested that the County proceed cautiously when considering future renewable energy development. Mr. Lara also expressed support for consideration of a moratorium on such projects.

**Michael Samuel**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding public participation and proposed renewable energy development. Mr. Samuel thanked the Commission members for their service and encouraged the Commission to consider the interests of residents in its decision-making process. He expressed support for a moratorium on renewable energy projects and raised concerns regarding potential impacts to public health, wildlife, and the surrounding environment. Mr. Samuel also commented on the proximity of proposed projects to volcanic areas and questioned whether environmental impact studies had been completed regarding potential effects on wildlife migration and habitat.

**Linda Philbrook**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed Black Ridge wind project and requested consideration of a moratorium on the project until additional studies and review could be completed. Ms. Philbrook expressed concerns regarding potential impacts to birds, bats, wildlife habitat, nearby residents, and local water resources. She also commented on possible effects associated with turbine vibration, shadow flicker, large-scale construction activity, and development within environmentally and geologically sensitive areas. Ms. Philbrook requested that the

Approval June 3, 2026

County require additional independent studies and protections prior to approving future renewable energy development and expressed concerns regarding long-term accountability for potential project impacts on the community and natural resources.

**Laura Solie** yielded her time to Joan Garrett.

**Louisa Quintana**, a resident of Eagar, Arizona, addressed the Commission on behalf of Arizona White Mountain Safe Open Spaces and stated that the organization represented more than 1,200 Apache County residents. Ms. Quintana submitted a letter for inclusion in the official record regarding concerns with the renewable energy ordinance update process. She commented on public access to draft ordinance materials, communications between County staff and renewable energy industry representatives, the timing of ordinance revisions being posted prior to meetings, and the overall transparency of the process. Ms. Quintana also stated that the Commission should take a more active role in the ordinance update process and recommended the establishment of a subcommittee involving commissioners and residents, additional public review opportunities, earlier posting of draft materials, and consideration of a moratorium on renewable energy projects until the ordinance amendments are finalized and adopted by the Board of Supervisors. The letter was received by the Commission and entered into the meeting record. A copy of the correspondence is maintained with the meeting file.

**Barbara Norton** yielded her time to Monica Boehning.

**Tina Ellis** yielded her time to Monica Boehning.

**Joni Smead**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy development and expressed support for locating future projects within the County's proposed preferred energy areas if such projects are approved. Ms. Smead expressed concerns regarding the proximity of wind turbines to residential communities, including potential impacts related to noise, lighting, property values, land use, wildlife, and quality of life. She commented that renewable energy facilities should not be located near residential areas and stated concerns regarding the long-term effects of wind and solar projects on the surrounding landscape and future generations. Ms. Smead also expressed support for consideration of a moratorium on renewable energy projects.

**Kimberley Autrey**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and ordinance amendments, including the Black Ridge project. Ms. Autrey stated that she opposed wind turbine and solar development projects within Apache County and expressed concerns that the proposed ordinance amendments favored developers rather than County residents and natural resources. She recommended that the ordinance include a maximum turbine height limitation and commented on potential lighting requirements associated with taller turbines and possible impacts to dark sky conditions. Ms. Autrey also raised concerns regarding Battery Energy Storage Systems (BESS), including potential fire, safety, and environmental risks, and stated that such facilities should be addressed within the ordinance amendments. Ms. Autrey expressed support for consideration of a moratorium on renewable energy projects.

**Mark Seipke**, a resident of Greer, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding public communications and information related to proposed renewable energy development projects. Mr.

Seipke referenced prior public meetings and statements made by project representatives regarding economic impacts associated with the closure of local power plants. He expressed concerns that information presented to the public regarding economic conditions and project benefits may no longer reflect current circumstances due to changes involving the generating stations. Mr. Seipke requested that updated information be provided to the public and recommended additional public meetings and discussions regarding current project data and impacts. Mr. Seipke also expressed support for consideration of a moratorium on renewable energy projects.

**Rickey Malot** yielded his time to Daniel Hochstein.

**Nancy Quinn**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding economic conditions within Apache County and potential benefits associated with renewable energy development projects. Ms. Quinn commented on financial hardships experienced by residents, including housing affordability, homelessness, business closures, and economic challenges facing local families and ranchers. She stated that renewable energy projects could provide economic opportunities, partnerships for ranchers, and additional revenue for schools and community improvements. Ms. Quinn also referenced community donations associated with the Black Ridge project and expressed her view that such projects could provide needed economic support for Apache County communities.

**Lorraine Vaught**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding concerns related to proposed wind energy development projects. Ms. Vaught stated that she and her husband had lived in the White Mountains area for more than 20 years and expressed concerns regarding potential health impacts and quality-of-life effects associated with nearby wind turbine development. She requested additional studies regarding potential vibration impacts, subsurface geological conditions, and possible effects associated with turbine foundations and construction in volcanic cinder and ash areas. Ms. Vaught also expressed concerns regarding potential impacts on current and future residents and requested consideration of a moratorium while additional studies are completed.

**Terry Tignor**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed wind energy projects in Apache County. Mr. Tignor stated that residents in Vernon, Concho, Springerville, and Greer would be significantly affected by the projects and expressed concerns regarding the economic and environmental viability of wind energy development. He referenced federal discussions and reports concerning potential impacts of wind turbines on radio frequency communications, radar systems, aviation, government communications, and national security. Mr. Tignor also referenced recent reports concerning delays or reviews of wind energy projects by federal agencies and expressed support for consideration of a moratorium on renewable energy projects.

**Ron Smead**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects, including the Lava Run and Black Ridge projects. Mr. Smead stated that he and his wife moved to the White Mountains area seeking a rural lifestyle and expressed concerns regarding potential impacts of renewable energy development on the surrounding environment and community character. He commented on concerns related to water use, wildfires, health impacts, communications systems, and wildlife. Mr. Smead referenced a wind energy project in New Mexico and discussed reported water usage associated with construction and dust control activities, expressing concerns regarding possible impacts to local aquifers and

Approval June 3, 2026

water resources in Apache County. Mr. Smead requested that the Commission consider the concerns expressed by local residents when making future decisions regarding renewable energy projects.

**Rick Ellis** yielded his time to Monica Boehning.

**Monica Boehning**, a resident of Springerville, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed renewable energy ordinance amendments and expressed support for adoption of a moratorium on renewable energy projects. Ms. Boehning discussed concerns related to potential impacts on radio frequency communications infrastructure, groundwater resources, and aquifer depletion. She referenced studies and technical information regarding water use and infrastructure impacts associated with renewable energy development. Ms. Boehning also expressed concerns regarding the ordinance amendment process, including the timing of draft revisions, opportunities for public review, and the pace of the ordinance updates. She recommended that the County complete the ordinance revision process and additional studies prior to accepting further renewable energy applications.

**Joan Garrett**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding renewable energy regulations and potential legal concerns related to stricter siting standards and setbacks for wind and solar projects. Ms. Garrett referenced reports and studies discussing local and state restrictions on utility-scale renewable energy development across the United States and stated that many jurisdictions have adopted more restrictive siting regulations. She commented that Apache County currently remains a relatively permissive jurisdiction for renewable energy projects and encouraged the Commission to adopt stronger standards and protections for County residents prior to future project development.

**Mason Grainger**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and expressed opposition to additional energy development within Apache County. Mr. Grainger discussed concerns related to climate change, environmental impacts, wildlife habitat, and the potential effects of wind energy development on local ecosystems and bird species. He referenced personal observations from an existing wind energy facility and expressed concerns regarding turbine noise, visual impacts, and potential effects on nearby residents and property values. Mr. Grainger also requested that the County adopt larger setback requirements for future renewable energy projects.

**Brian Burke**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed wind energy development and expressed concerns about potential impacts to the area's dark skies, rural character, and quality of life. Mr. Burke discussed concerns related to turbine noise and referenced information from the National Institutes of Health and World Health Organization regarding recommended sound levels for wind turbines near residences. He stated that the proposed ordinance noise standards were higher than the recommendations he reviewed and expressed concerns regarding provisions allowing waivers from established noise limits.

**Peggy Miner**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy development and encouraged the Commission to take additional time to consider long-term impacts associated with future projects. Ms. Miner expressed concerns regarding protection of water resources, including the Little Colorado River watershed and regional aquifers, and suggested that renewable energy projects should be subject to long-term

Approval June 3, 2026

water availability considerations similar to subdivision requirements in Arizona. She also raised concerns regarding decommissioning requirements, potential environmental impacts from damaged equipment and materials, and future cleanup responsibilities associated with renewable energy facilities.

**Daniel Hochstein**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed Black Ridge and Lava Run renewable energy projects and requested consideration of a moratorium until additional independent studies could be completed. Mr. Hochstein expressed concerns regarding potential impacts to aquifers, drinking water, residential areas, air quality, and public health. He also commented on proposed ordinance language related to preferred energy generation areas and stated that the County should establish more specific siting criteria for renewable energy facilities. Mr. Hochstein further expressed concerns regarding property rights, environmental impacts, and the proximity of proposed industrial-scale energy facilities to residential communities.

Commissioner Kay Hauser left the meeting during Call to the Public. A quorum remained present.

**Lonnie Randall**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed Black Ridge wind project and related comprehensive plan amendments. Mr. Randall expressed opposition to amending the Comprehensive Plan for the purpose of accommodating renewable energy development and stated concerns regarding the scale and size of the proposed turbines, construction impacts, water usage, and potential effects on the surrounding landscape and dark skies within the Springerville volcanic field area. He referenced observations from an existing wind energy facility and commented on turbine foundations, concrete requirements, and construction-related water use. Mr. Randall expressed support for a moratorium on renewable energy projects and also requested denial of future conditional use permits for such developments.

**Jeannene Randall** yielded her time.

**Darcy Deskin**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy development and expressed support for adoption of a moratorium to allow additional time for study and review. Ms. Deskin raised concerns regarding the suitability of volcanic soils and geological conditions for large-scale wind turbine construction, potential water use and aquifer impacts during drought conditions, and possible effects on wildlife, including birds, bats, and game animals. She also expressed concerns regarding turbine noise, visual impacts, and the long-term effects of renewable energy development on the local environment and community.

**Lisa Long**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed Black Ridge and Lava Run renewable energy projects and expressed support for a moratorium until additional independent third-party studies could be completed. Ms. Long raised concerns regarding potential impacts of wind turbine construction and vibration on aquifers, water resources, land, and surrounding communities. She also expressed concerns regarding ordinance language she viewed as vague or open to interpretation and requested that the ordinance include more specific and clearly defined standards and requirements.

**John Gillespie**, a resident of Mesa, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding renewable energy development and land use regulation. Mr. Gillespie stated that he works as a land use attorney on renewable energy projects throughout Arizona and discussed the importance of balancing private property rights, economic considerations, and appropriate regulation. He commented that renewable energy projects should be evaluated through science-based standards and supported by studies and documentation provided by developers. Mr. Gillespie encouraged the Commission to consider the County's Comprehensive Plan, private property interests, and the overall needs of the County when reviewing renewable energy projects and ordinance standards. He also stated support for evaluating conditional use permits on an individual basis under an established ordinance framework.

**Kathy Russell**, a resident of St. Johns, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy development projects and expressed concerns regarding future expansion of wind energy facilities within Apache County. Ms. Russell referenced observations from wind energy facilities in California and Wyoming and expressed concerns regarding turbine maintenance, wildlife impacts, fire risks, and long-term project upkeep. She requested that the County require detailed environmental studies and maintenance requirements for future projects and expressed support for adoption of a moratorium to allow additional review and regulation. Ms. Russell also commented on economic development within Apache County and encouraged the County to support local businesses and redevelopment opportunities within existing communities.

**Andy Huyck**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding drought conditions, water availability, and proposed renewable energy development projects. Mr. Huyck referenced reports concerning drought conditions and declining water levels in Arizona reservoirs and waterways and expressed concerns regarding water use associated with renewable energy development. He also commented on the manufacturing and energy production associated with renewable energy technologies and expressed concerns regarding the scale and height of proposed wind turbines. Mr. Huyck requested additional research and study regarding potential long-term impacts of renewable energy projects and emphasized the importance of protecting local land and natural resources.

**Lisa Ronsick**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and stated that the issue was important to her family. Ms. Ronsick expressed opposition to the Repsol and Triple Oak projects and stated her belief that many Apache County residents oppose the proposed developments. She also commented on community involvement in the public process and expressed concerns regarding the potential impacts of renewable energy development on the White Mountains area and surrounding communities.

**Jackson Ronsick**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed wind energy development projects. Mr. Ronsick expressed concerns regarding potential impacts on wildlife, including birds and game animals, as well as possible impacts to aquifers and local water resources during drought conditions. He also commented on potential effects to dark skies, scenic views, and the rural character of the White Mountains area and expressed opposition to locating wind turbines near residential communities.

**Daisy Ronsick**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed wind energy projects and expressed opposition to the developments. Ms. Ronsick stated concerns regarding potential impacts to the mountains, wildlife, scenic views, and rural character of the area. She also expressed concerns regarding turbine visibility and noise and stated that she wished to preserve the surrounding environment and outdoor experiences for future generations.

**Wayne Ronsick**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed wind energy projects and expressed concerns regarding potential impacts on the quiet and natural character of the surrounding forest and mountain areas. Mr. Ronsick stated that he enjoys outdoor recreation activities in the area and expressed opposition to the potential noise and visual impacts associated with wind turbines.

**Kasey Cameron** did not speak to the commission.

**Michael Eaton**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and the rural character of the area. Mr. Eaton stated that he relocated to Apache County seeking affordable housing and a quieter lifestyle and commented that many residents living in rural areas value the area's natural environment and separation from urban conditions. He expressed concerns regarding potential health and quality-of-life impacts associated with wind turbines, including possible effects related to noise, stress, sleep disruption, and mental well-being. Mr. Eaton also expressed concerns regarding potential impacts on families and future residents living near proposed projects.

**Shanna Penrod**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed Lava Run and Black Ridge renewable energy projects. Ms. Penrod stated her opposition to the projects and requested consideration of a moratorium until independent third-party studies could be completed regarding potential impacts to the environment, local communities, and aquifers. Ms. Penrod also stated that County officials should prioritize the interests and concerns of Apache County residents when considering future renewable energy development proposals.

**Betsy Lagos**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed size and impacts of the Lava Run and Black Ridge wind energy projects. Ms. Lagos presented a scaled comparison drawing showing the height of the proposed wind turbines relative to buildings in the Phoenix skyline and expressed concerns regarding the visual scale of the projects, including lighting and turbine visibility. She also raised concerns regarding water usage for construction, soil disturbance, groundwater contamination, and potential impacts associated with volcanic soils and turbine vibration. In addition, Ms. Lagos expressed concerns regarding wildfire risks and the potential need for additional water resources in the event of turbine or transmission-related fires.

**Brannon Morales**, a resident of St. Johns, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed wind and solar energy projects in Apache and Navajo Counties. Mr. Morales expressed opposition to renewable energy development projects and stated concerns regarding potential long-term impacts on local communities, land, water resources, ranching operations, and the regional economy. He also expressed concerns regarding outside investment influences, government decision-making, and the perceived lack of local benefit from proposed projects,

including employment opportunities. Mr. Morales encouraged residents and County officials to remain involved in the public process and to consider the long-term effects of renewable energy development on local communities and future generations.

**Doug Fletcher**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and expressed opposition to wind turbine development in Apache County. Mr. Fletcher stated that he had researched wind turbines and related infrastructure projects throughout the country and expressed concerns regarding potential impacts to wildlife, water resources, wildfire response, and local communities. He stated his belief that the projects would primarily benefit outside interests rather than local residents and expressed support for both a moratorium and denial of future renewable energy projects. Mr. Fletcher also referenced discussions involving community development opportunities and concerns regarding impacts to local and Tribal communities.

**Kristin Spillman**, a resident of Springerville, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding renewable energy ordinance discussions and public participation in the process. Ms. Spillman referenced informational materials and packets previously provided to the Commission and Board of Supervisors regarding concerns raised by Arizona Mountains SOS. She also expressed support for live streaming and remote public access options for future Planning and Zoning meetings to increase accessibility for residents unable to attend in person. In addition, Ms. Spillman stated that petitions supporting a moratorium on renewable energy projects were being circulated for public signatures and expressed support for consideration of a moratorium.

**Jackson Brown**, a resident of St. Johns, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and expressed opposition to a moratorium. Mr. Brown stated his support for private property rights and renewable energy investment within Apache County and commented that additional economic development opportunities should be considered to support local schools and the County economy. He acknowledged concerns raised regarding project impacts, including lighting and dark skies, but stated that such concerns should be weighed against potential economic benefits and mitigation measures. Mr. Brown also referenced development occurring in neighboring counties and encouraged consideration of the potential benefits associated with renewable energy projects.

**Margaret Weir Singalli**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding proposed renewable energy projects and expressed support for adoption of a moratorium due to the number of projects being proposed within the area. Ms. Singalli referenced actions taken by other Arizona counties related to temporary moratoriums and stated that additional time was needed to review and strengthen ordinance standards. She also commented that economic and energy-related conditions had changed since the projects were first proposed and expressed concerns regarding the projected distribution of tax revenues associated with renewable energy development.

**Steve Hall**, a resident of Concho, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding residential growth and proposed renewable energy development within Apache County. Mr. Hall stated that he had invested in residential property and construction within the area and expressed his belief that the County is experiencing gradual residential and economic growth compatible with available local resources. He discussed water conservation practices, including rainwater harvesting, and suggested the County consider related regulations or incentives. Mr. Hall also

Approval June 3, 2026

commented on property rights, potential impacts of renewable energy development on residential investment and future growth, and concerns that large-scale industrial projects could discourage future residents and property investment within the area.

**Rick Wannigar**, a resident of Vernon, Arizona, addressed the Commission regarding the proposed preferred energy generation areas and questioned why proposed renewable energy projects were being considered near Vernon rather than within the identified preferred areas. Chair Brad Peterson responded that some project planning and development activities had begun prior to discussions regarding preferred energy areas. Community Development Director Matthew Fish stated that the Call to the Public was not a question-and-answer session and invited Mr. Wannigar to contact his office separately to discuss the matter further.

Chairman Peterson closed Call to the Public.

### **REPORT FROM STAFF**

Mr. Fish asked commissioners whether they preferred receiving proposed ordinance revisions in advance of the May 26, 2026 special work session. Chair Peterson indicated support for receiving the materials in advance. No additional staff reports were provided.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

**MOTION:** Commissioner Carey Dobson moved to adjourn the meeting. Second Commissioner Brad Jarvis.

**Vote:** Unanimous five (5) ayes, zero (0) nays.

Chair Brad Peterson adjourned the Public Meeting at 7:01 p.m. (MST).

### **NEXT MEETING**

The next regular meeting of the Planning and Zoning Commission is scheduled for Wednesday, June 3, 2026.

Approved this 3<sup>rd</sup> day of June 2026.

/s/ Brad Peterson  
Chairman of the Commission

/s/ Matthew Fish  
Planning & Zoning Secretary