

OFFICIAL PROCEEDINGS OF THE APACHE COUNTY
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS' MEETING

May 5, 2026
St. Johns, Arizona

Present were Supervisor Nelson Davis and Chief Deputy County Attorney Chris Resare. Chairman Alton Joe Shepherd, Vice Chairman Joe Shirley, Jr. and Ryan Patterson Clerk of the Board/Manager participated via the telephone.

Chairman Shepherd called to order the Board of Supervisors meeting at 8:34 a.m. in the Board of Supervisors' chambers, County Annex Building, 75 West Cleveland Street, St. Johns, Arizona and welcomed all in attendance.

Joseph Langkilde gave the invocation.

Rita Vaughn led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Shepherd called for the agenda items.

Mr. Patterson presented the Consent Agenda items A-I and recommended approval **Mr. Shirley moved approval seconded by Mr. Davis.** County Manager/Clerk of the Board: A. Finance Department: Request approval of demands as distributed to the Apache County Board of Supervisors between April 1, 2026, through April 30, 2026. Payee Amount NATIONAL BANK \$37804.39 MARLEITA BEGAY \$1351.50 DAVID JULIAN ROMERO \$1173.86 APACHE COUNTY HSA \$7855.12 APACHE COUNTY MEDICAL \$218960.41 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$176318.49 ASRS LEGACY EORP\$12005.21 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM \$137415.72 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET PLAN \$16301.81 EORP LEGACY \$5475.60 NATIONWIDE \$4839.42 NATIONWIDE RETIREMENT SOL EODCRS \$1429.92 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$4479.02 PUBLIC SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$12141.04 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET \$13807.02 SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$1076.91 TRENTON PADILLA \$1624.00 AARONS & MONTI LLC \$3000.00 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$10931.09 AXON ENTERPRISE INC \$13602.53 AZ DEPT OF RISK MANAGEMENT \$1986.13 WESLEY LEE BEN \$2000.00 BOOT BARN \$3742.80 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$3226.20 C&I SHOW HARDWARE & SECURITY SYSTEMS INC \$4107.95 CATERPILLAR FINANCIAL SERVICES CORPORATION \$69613.68 CDW GOVERNMENT LLC \$144764.04 EATON SALES & SERVICE \$1741.80 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$5074.08 FLEET PRIDE \$6917.36 FRONTIER \$1850.45 FUTURE TIRE \$2231.09 GOLIGHTLY TIRE \$2656.69 HAMBLIN LAW OFFICE PLC \$10500.00 HANCOCK COMPREHENSIVE DENTISTRY \$1190.00 KLINT HEAP \$1409.02 HIGH COUNTRY PROPANE \$1338.02 DENNISE L JONES \$3602.50 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY \$2476.81 NICOLL ELECTRIC LLC \$1200.00 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$3094.13 MICHAEL PENROD \$4306.50 QUILL CORP \$2194.43 R JOHN R JOHN LEE ATTORNEY AT LAW \$10500.00 RHINEHART OIL CO \$11354.68 SAFE LIFE DEFENSE, LLC \$10373.12 ST JOHNS EMERGENCY SERVICES \$4151.42 THOMSON REUTERS WEST \$1731.16 VALLEY AUTO PARTS \$1195.77 WAGNER EQUIPMENT CO \$1070.05 WRIGHT

EXPRESS FSC WEX \$6216.18 KTNN RADIO STATION \$2247.20 AMERICAN GRAPHICS
INSTITUTE LLC \$1495.00 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$9158.50
CAROLINE H FEATHERHAT \$1064.52 LETA HONNIE \$1064.96 MARLENE A TSOSIE
\$1007.26 SAMUEL A WOOD \$1705.82 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$8247.66
ALL TRAFFIC SOLUTIONS INC \$2129.90 AMAZON CAPITALSERVICES INC \$12334.14
APCO INTERNATIONAL INC \$29370.13 ARIZONA ELEVATOR SOLUTIONS INC
\$3377.70 AZ COUNTIES INSURANCE POOL \$5721.50 AZ COUNTIES WORKERS
COMPENSATION PLAN \$90963.91 AZ DEPT OF HEALTH SERVICES \$1585.00 BEACON
FIRE AND SECURITY LLC \$1916.94 BLUE HILLS ENVIRONMENTAL \$1141.00 BLUE
KNIGHT SECURITY LLC \$8750.00 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$35026.30
BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$3071.70 CORDANT HEALTH SOLUTIONS \$1648.25 CREATIVE
MULTIMEDIA INC (CMI) \$37265.00 DAKTRONICS INC \$1821.97 DELL COMPUTER
CORPORATION \$1523.72 DELTA TIRE LLC \$1268.61 CASSEY RAE DREW \$2637.50
EMPIRE MACHINERY \$1536.81 FLEET PRIDE \$1962.86 FRONTIER \$5356.22 GLOBAL
SENSORS \$1593.38 GREER COMMUNITY FACILITIES \$1040.10 HOME DEPOT ACCT
7600 \$1329.16 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES \$4592.68 MH CONSULTING & PROJECT
MANAGEMENT LLC \$5878.33 MOUNTAIN JUNK REMOVAL \$7900.00 MOVIE
LICENSING USA (SWANK) \$2244.00 NATIONAL BANK \$6434.36 NAVAJO TRIBAL
UTILITY AUTHORITY \$2433.05 OVERDRIVE INC \$1611.33 PACIFIC PONDEROSA CO
INC \$3543.12 PERFECT PRINTZ LLC \$2126.81 POLARIS PHARMACY SERVICES OF
WARRINGTON LLC \$6964.63 POWERSCREEN OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA INC
\$11887.14 QUILL CORP \$2326.19 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$3419.26
SPRINGERVILLE AUTOMOTIVE SERVICE \$1538.33 ST JOHNS CITY \$1633.81 STAN'S
DIESEL AND PERFORMANCE \$1114.96 TARTAN OIL LLC (FORMER NAME:
SARATOGA) \$20364.13 THOMSON REUTERS WEST \$2191.41 TUCSON CREMATION
SERVICES LLC \$1049.00 US POSTMASTER \$1080.00 US POSTMASTER \$26534.02
VERIZON WIRELESS \$5023.48 WHITE MOUNTAIN REGIONAL MEDICAL CENTER
\$6011.96 RODGER DAHOZY \$1207.82 APACHE COUNTY HSA \$7842.40 APACHE
COUNTY MEDICAL \$217523.76 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$174252.99
ASRS LEGACY EORP \$12005.21 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM \$137217.12
COLONIAL LIFE AND ACCIDENT INS \$1010.31 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET PLAN
\$16301.76 EORP LEGACY \$5608.75 NATIONWIDE \$4829.04 NATIONWIDE
RETIREMENT SOL EODCRS \$1464.69 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$4488.78 PUBLIC
SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$12141.04 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET \$14048.65
SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$1076.91 APACHE COUNTY TAX
WITHHOLDING \$1364.30 4ALLPROMOS \$1140.65 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES
INC \$9913.12 AZ SUPREME COURT \$1440.00 BEACON FIRE AND SECURITY LLC
\$1030.00 BLUE KNIGHT SECURITY LLC \$4125.00 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC
\$34652.43 BREWER LAW OFFICE PLLC \$10500.00 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$6565.50
DELL COMPUTER CORPORATION \$8729.43 CASSEY RAE DREW \$1262.50 EMPIRE
MACHINERY \$1665.01 FRONTIER \$2773.89 HOME DEPOT ACCT 7600 \$1087.30 HOME
DEPOT ACCT 4118 \$1564.44 NAPA \$1525.56 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY
\$5655.72 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$11853.03 NORTHLAND PIONEER
COLLEGE \$350000.00 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$2161.25 PCLIQUIDATIONS.COM
\$1172.61 PEPPERBALL \$4683.60 PERKINS CINDERS INC \$7475.98 PITNEY BOWES
RESERVE ACCOUNT \$5000.00 QUILL CORP \$2489.18 REDW LLC \$56087.50 ROUND

VALLEY ELKS BOOSTER CLUB LLC \$1000.00 RUSH TRUCK CENTER \$2890.55 SAFE RESTRAINTS INC \$1657.12 DALE SHAWN TAYLOR \$12500.00 DANIEL TAYLOR \$12500.00 MELDRUM MORTUARY \$1020.00 MICHAEL LATHAM \$6948.49 ACTION PLUMBING/REED SERVICES LLC \$3945.00 ADHS AZ HEALTH CARE COST \$22400.00 ADVANCED CORRECTIONAL HEALTHCARE INC \$48939.44 ALLEGRA \$6605.07 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$9229.21 ANDERSON RESOURCE GROUP \$3043.60 AZLGEBT \$423342.60 BACKWOODS TEES \$2854.59 BLUE KNIGHT SECURITY LLC \$4325.00 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$2313.10 COALITION OF ARIZONA NEW MEXICO COUNTIES \$2600.00 John Lucas COMMUNITY BROADBAND ADVOCATES LLC \$5818.10 DELL COMPUTER CORPORATION \$1412.94 DOYLES AUTO BODY INC \$3067.22 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$4248.27 FLAKE LEGAL PLLC \$10500.00 FLEET PRIDE \$1225.44 FRONTIER \$3596.90 FUTURE TIRE \$2016.76 HILLYARD/FLAGSTAFF \$1859.32 HUGHES HUGHES SUPPLY INC (FARMINGTON) \$1343.01 KYLE DOUGLAS MAYER \$1366.75 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$2560.47 OHENRY PRODUCTIONS INC \$4629.06 PREMIUM PROPANE LLC \$6510.47 QUILL CORP \$1760.11 RECON AIR SYSTEMS LLC \$27735.72 SANOFI PASTEUR INC \$10591.36 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$2968.99 SKAGGS PUBLIC SAFETY UNIFORMS & EQUIPMENT \$1300.25 TAFT STETTINIUS & HOLLISTER LLP \$3410.00 TRANE US INC \$6930.00 VALLEY AUTO PARTS \$3611.21 VERIZON WIRELESS \$1253.43 WHITE MOUNTAIN PUBLISHING CO – DO NOT USE \$2546.76 JEFFREY CRANE \$1232.50

Demands are payments made, or to be made by the County. Specific details of the demands may be requested through the County public record request process.

B. Request approval of minutes dated March 24, 2026, and April 7, 2026.

C. Request approval of the lease agreement between Apache County and Arizona Department of Transportation for a Motor Vehicle Division located at the Chinle Road Yard.

D. Request approval of the waiver of tax exemption for C. Wayne and Diane N. Ledford, Parcel 212-32-162C pursuant to A.R.S. §42-11153. The disability exemption was filed late due to an oversight.

E. Request approval of the waiver of tax exemption for Gloria Weickers, Parcel 106-64-122 pursuant to A.R.S. §42-11153. The disability exemption was filed late due to an oversight.

F. Request approval of the waiver of tax exemption for Ryan Bottachiari, Parcel 104-51-039 pursuant to A.R.S. §42-11153. The disability exemption was filed late due to an oversight.

G. Request approval to allow the Escudilla Mountain Domestic Water Improvement District to hold a mail ballot election, pursuant to A.R.S. §16-227. Finance Department:

H. Request approval for Clayton Overson (Assistant Finance Director) and Joseph Langkilde (Finance Director) to be listed as the point of contact for Navopache Electric.

I. Request approval to amend the FY2026 budgeted expenditure increase for Fund 204 – HAVA for \$110,000 and a corresponding expenditure decrease to Fund 220 Misc.Grants for \$110,000 for a net budget impact of zero. Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson, on behalf of CDBG, requested approval to reject bids received for the CDBG Vernon Food Pantry Project and advertise a second bid with changes in the scope of work.

Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley. Vote was unanimous.

Megan Hill, Election Director, requested approval of an adjustment to Poll Workers and Election Board pay. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Commander John Scruggs, on behalf of the Sheriff's Office, requested approval of an Intergovernmental Agreement with the Phoenix Police Department for participation in the Internet Crimes Against Children Task Force. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson requested the item for the Finance Department to allocate a percentage of the Secure Rural Schools (SRS) payment of \$540,320.07 for FY2024 between public roads and public schools be removed from the agenda. **Mr. Shirley moved to remove the item, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson presented notification of the following meetings where two or more members of the Apache County Board of Supervisors may be in attendance. No action was needed or taken.

- The Eastern Arizona Counties Organization meeting on May 20, 2026, at 2:00 p.m. to be held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.
- Small Counties Forum meeting on May 20, 2026, at 5:30 p.m. to be held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.
- The County Supervisors Association (CSA) meeting on May 21, 2026, at 10:00 a.m. to be held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.

Chairman Shepherd opened the floor for call to the public and informed the audience that due to the large group of individuals, there would be no transfer of time and will limit speakers to two minutes. Chairman Shepherd stated since he and Vice Chairman Shirley are not present, he was turning the gavel over to Supervisor Davis to conduct the call to the public.

Supervisor Davis stated there were 20-25 people wishing to speak and there would be a two minute time limit with no transfer of time, and thanked everyone for attending the meeting and exercising their right to voice their opinion.

Tera Davis stated she did not want to speak at this time.

Ricky Malott requested his time be transferred. Supervisor Davis informed him there would be no transfer of time.

Daniel Hochstein, a resident of Vernon, spoke in opposition to Black Ridge and Lava Run wind projects.

Kristen Spillman stated she did not want to speak at this time.

James Richard, a resident of Concho, expressed his opposition to the wind turbines and his concern with the water wells being negatively impacted.

Doug Fletcher stated he is opposed to the AI data centers and windmills and the water that is used and is pushing to a moratorium on them in the county.

Mike Lara, a resident of Vernon, stated he is against the wind turbine projects and stated he is not against energy but requested the Board slow down and think of the long-term impact this will bring to the county and requested a moratorium on the wind energy project.

Michael Samuel, a resident of Vernon, has been attending the board meeting for a couple months and has not seen a single person in support of the wind turbines and he is tired of paying taxes and not getting representation by the government leaders.

Tina Ellis, a resident of Vernon, expressed her opposition to wind turbine projects.

Kimberly Autrey, a resident of Concho, stated she is in opposition to all wind turbine and solar project in the county and referenced the County's comprehensive plan for protecting the environment.

Jeannene Randall, a resident of Concho, expressed her opposition to the wind turbines.

Margaret Weir-Sangalli, a resident of Vernon, stated her opposition to the wind turbine Project and her concern with the project development companies.

Lonnie Randall, a resident of Concho, addressed the Board regarding his concern with the right-of-way permit for Black Ridge and the county should not change the comprehensive plan to accommodate wind and solar farms.

Tom Dawson spoke in opposition to wind turbines.

Mark Seipke, a resident of Greer, submitted a letter from the White Mountain Save Open Spaces group in opposition to wind turbines and expressed his concern with the county sharing draft documents with renewable energy companies.

Linda Philbrook, a resident of Vernon, requested the Board pause the Blackridge wind project until its full impacts area understood, as well as issue a moratorium.

Joan Garrett, a resident of Vernon, provided statistics and expressed her opposition to the wind turbine projects.

Terry Tignot, a resident of Vernon, stated his objection to wind turbines and interfere with aviation communications and local communications and asked for a moratorium due to the destruction to the lava rock.

Lorraine Vaught, a resident of Vernon, expressed her opposition to wind turbines and asked for a moratorium be imposed for health reasons.

Joan Smead, a resident of Vernon, expressed her opposition to wind turbines and requested a moratorium.

Susan Maxwell, a resident of Vernon, stated she is against wind turbines due to health concerns. Donald Maxwell, a resident of Vernon, expressed his concern with water use and his opposition to wind turbines.

Monica Boehning, a resident of Springerville, provided documents to the Board and requested a moratorium on renewable energy.

Barbara Norton, resident of Eagar, expressed her opposition to wind turbines and stated the community does not want these projects.

Lisa Long, a resident of Vernon, stated she objects to the proposed wind energy projects especially Blackridge and Lava Run and requested a moratorium.

Jennifer Moreira a resident of Concho, stated full disclosure, she is a reporter for the White Mountain Independent. Ms. Moreira stated she hadn't planned on speaking today and understands there is a time limit that is in the current policy however, not allowing to yield time, she has three questions; 1. What is the Board's official policy on whether speakers may yield or combine their time during public comment. 2. If yielding time is not allowed today, when was that rule established or changed and where is it documented and 3. Why was yielding time permitted in recent meetings including the liquor license that was a couple months ago where time was yielded; that is inconsistent. Ms. Moreira stated Planning and Zoning also allows the yielding of time and the current policy published for call to the public states "individuals may address the Board on any relevant issue for an amount of time determined by the Chairman. At the close of the call to the public Board members may not respond to any comments but may respond to criticism, ask staff to review a matter, or ask the matter be placed on a future agenda". Ms. Moreira stated in her opinion, what happened today looks like a silence of voices and a possible First Amendment issue.

Supervisor Davis asked Mr. Patterson to work with legal regarding those questions.

Kristen Spillman, stated she would like to see time yielded to Monica Boehning since she has pertinent things to say regarding the moratorium.

There was no one else wanting to address the Board during call to the public.

Supervisor Davis stated if he could assume the privilege from Chairman Shepherd, he called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. **Chairman Shepherd made the motion to adjourn, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Approved this 2nd day of June, 2026.

/s/ Alton Joe Shepherd
Chairman of the Board

/s/ Ryan N. Patterson
Clerk of the Board