

OFFICIAL PROCEEDINGS OF THE APACHE COUNTY  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS' MEETING

March 3, 2026  
St. Johns, Arizona

Present were, Chairman Alton Joe Shepherd, Vice Chairman Joe Shirley, Jr. and Supervisor Nelson Davis. Also present, Ryan Patterson Clerk of the Board/Manager, County Attorney Jasmine Blackwater-Nygren and Chief Deputy County Attorney Chris Resare.

Chairman Shepherd called to order the Board of Supervisors meeting at 8:30 a.m. in the Board of Supervisors' chambers, County Annex Building, 75 West Cleveland Street, St. Johns, Arizona and welcomed all in attendance.

Matt Fish gave the invocation.

Jesse Thomas led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Shepherd called for the Health District items

Kimberly Cole, Health Director, requested approval of the Medical Consultant Agreement with Dr. Jeffery Reres effective 01/01/2026 and this agreement allows our clinics to operate under the direction of a licensed physician in the amount of \$5,000.00 for a 180 day period and is budgeted for FY26. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Kimberly Cole, Health Director, requested approval of the Lease Agreement with Burnham Funeral Services effective 02/01/26 in the amount of \$600.00 a month to house two refrigeration units. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

**Mr. Shirley moved to adjourn the Health District meeting seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Chairman Shepherd called for the Library District items.

Keirsten Nielsen, Library Director, requested approval to formally accept ownership of an existing storage shed located on Alpine Public Library property. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Keirsten Nielsen, Library Director, requested approval of a lease agreement between Apache County Library District and the Bush Valley Craft Club from March 15, 2026, through March 14, 2027, at the rate of \$20.00 per year. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Keirsten Nielsen, Library Director, requested approval to extend our contract with Gila Broadband, for internet services to the Alpine Library, under the original Service Agreement and Proposal for one year. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Keirsten Nielsen, Library Director, requested approval for a one-year extension for internet services provided by NTUA Wireless LLC. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Keirsten Nielsen, Library Director, approval to accept a \$51,000.00 donation from Salt River Project (SRP) for capital improvements consisting of parking lot repaving at the St. Johns Library Administration, St. Johns Public Library and Round Valley Library. Mrs. Nielsen introduced and thanked Hank Hamblin, SRP Plant Manager, for the donation. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Mr. Davis thanked Mr. Hamblin and SRP for the donation. Vote was unanimous.

**Mr. Shirley moved to adjourn the Library District meeting, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Chairman Shepherd called for the regular agenda items.

Mr. Patterson presented the Consent Agenda items A-F and recommended approval. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** A. Finance Department: Request approval of demands as distributed to the Apache County Board of Supervisors between January 26, 2026, to February 18, 2026. Demands are payments made, or to be made by the County. Payee Amount  
ADHS AZ HEALTH CARE COST \$22400.00 ALLEGRA \$2175.63 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$4478.84 AMERICAN FIRE EQUIPMENT (HILLER) \$5420.66 AXON ENTERPRISE INC \$1408.13 BLUE KNIGHT SECURITY LLC \$4325.00 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$14139.77 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$1313.10 CMI INC \$11633.31 EMS SOLUTIONS LLC \$7440.00 GREER COMMUNITY FACILITIES \$1040.10 HIGH COUNTRY PROPANE \$2121.78 KIMBALL EQUIPMENT COMPANY \$3827.86 MCCOOK BOILER AND PUMP COMPANY \$11180.65 NAPA \$1470.43 NAVAJO COUNTY \$4559.58 NAVAJO NATION \$1200.00 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$12075.05 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$1587.71 OVERDRIVE INC \$1748.89 PREMIUM PROPANE LLC \$2184.18 QUILL CORP \$1192.57 RHINEHART OIL CO \$1130.50 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$1458.92 SIERRA PROPANE \$1837.95 SILVER CREEK MORTUARY LLC (TAYLOR AZ) \$1424.50 SOUTHERN TIRE MART LLC \$5773.91 ST JOHNS EMERGENCY SERVICES \$1539.87 DALE SHAWN TAYLOR \$12500.00 DANIEL TAYLOR \$12500.00 VERIZON WIRELESS \$1347.52 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$207491.20 ASRS LEGACY EORP \$12005.21 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM \$139718.08 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET PLAN \$15760.20 EORP LEGACY \$5475.60 NATIONWIDE \$3693.43 NATIONWIDE RETIREMENT SOL EODCRS \$1429.92 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$2443.59 PUBLIC SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$12141.04 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET \$14529.38 AARONS & MONTI LLC \$3000.00 MODERNA US INC \$8505.42 PROPELLER AERO INC \$25200.00 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$2833.52 BAUER K BROWN \$1025.17 ALBERT N CLARK \$2619.69 DONALD KEVIN DAVIS \$2619.69 NORMAN TRENT NEWELL JR \$1219.05 DOUGLAS LANCE PEARCE \$1419.38 ROGELIO SANCHEZ \$1207.45 JOE SHIRLEY JR \$1095.31 JAY YELLOWHORSE \$1076.07 AARONS & MONTI LLC \$3000.00 ADVANCED CORRECTIONAL HEALTHCARE INC \$48530.42 ALLEGRA \$4134.10 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$3378.97 APACHE COUNTY \$1000.00 ARMORTEX INC

\$5922.00 AT&T MOBILITY LLC (FIRSTNET) \$5934.55 AZ DEPT OF RISK  
MANAGEMENT \$3003.32 AZLGEBT \$453152.29 CATERPILLAR FINANCIAL SERVICES  
CORPORATION \$90615.84 CDW GOVERNMENT LLC \$14955.12 COMMNET WIRELESS  
\$1900.00 John Lucas COMMUNITY BROADBAND ADVOCATES LLC \$6068.61  
FREEDOM PSYCHOLOGICAL CENTER \$1170.00 FUTURE TIRE \$1599.63 HAMBLIN  
LAW OFFICE PLC \$10500.00 HILLYARD/FLAGSTAFF \$1338.66 INGRAM LIBRARY  
SERVICES \$4400.23 DENNISE L JONES \$4413.75 CHERYL JUDGE \$1648.35 FELICIA K  
KEE \$1181.76 MH CONSULTING & PROJECT MANAGEMENT LLC \$1667.43 NTUA  
WIRELESS, LLC \$4829.37 MICHAEL PENROD \$2871.90 PEPPERBALL \$3900.00  
PERFECT PRINTZ LLC \$1438.26 PREMIUM PROPANE LLC \$3274.51 QUILL CORP  
\$1708.08 RHINEHART OIL CO \$9726.31 RUSH TRUCK CENTER \$1121.18 SAN DIEGO  
POLICE EQUIPMENT CO INC \$1567.46 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$1304.69  
SPEEDY SALES AND SERVICE \$1033.50 TRINITY SERVICES GROUP INC \$23088.90  
ULINE INC \$1673.24 WRIGHT EXPRESS FSC WEX \$3739.61 REDW LLC \$116181.00  
ALTON JOE SHEPHERD \$1186.65 NATIONAL BANK \$25123.08 NATIONAL BANK OF  
ARIZONA 2172 \$1929.80 NATIONAL BANK OF ARIZONA 2901 \$1141.63 A-1 GLASS  
AND MIRROR INC \$9918.62 ADVANCED CORRECTIONAL HEALTHCARE INC  
\$2426.52 ALSCO INC \$1910.00 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$9904.76 AMIGO  
CHEVROLET \$2406.56 APACHE COUNTY YOUTH COUNCIL \$1250.00 AZLGEBT  
\$432354.97 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$20675.38 BREWER LAW OFFICE PLLC  
\$10500.00 CDW GOVERNMENT LLC \$1408.58 CREATIVE MULTIMEDIA INC (CMI)  
\$15732.50 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$2900.80 EW PARKER ENTERPRISES LLC \$43659.00  
FERRELLGAS \$1585.89 GREEN MEADOWS FUNERAL HOME LLC \$1987.50 KLINT  
HEAP \$1340.00 HIGH COUNTRY SIGNS LLC \$5255.00 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES  
\$6590.96 JOHNSON CONTROLS FIRE PROTECTION LP \$2619.19 KUHLMAN  
PSYCHOLOGY & CONSULTING PLLC \$1000.00 MCMULLEN COUNTY SHERIFFS  
OFFICE \$5000.00 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$7348.10 O'REILLY AUTO  
PARTS \$2005.29 OVERDRIVE INC \$2944.27 POLARIS PHARMACY SERVICES OF  
WARRINGTON LLC \$3752.53 QUILL CORP \$3309.64 R JOHN R JOHN LEE ATTORNEY  
AT LAW \$10500.00 RHINEHART OIL CO \$3959.94 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC  
\$1651.78 SIERRA PROPANE \$1408.80 SKAGGS PUBLIC SAFETY UNIFORMS &  
EQUIPMENT \$2113.36 SPEEDY SALES AND SERVICE \$9985.89 ST JOHNS CITY  
\$1123.52 TARTAN OIL LLC (FORMER NAME: SARATOGA) \$13957.74 THOMSON  
REUTERS WEST \$3922.57 UNITED INFORMATION SERVICES \$2677.78 WESTERN  
ENVIRONMENTAL LINER \$6954.57 APACHE COUNTY HSA \$8003.18 APACHE  
COUNTY MEDICAL \$216306.64 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING  
\$190842.97 ASRS LEGACY EORP \$12005.21 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM  
\$137285.45 COLONIAL LIFE AND ACCIDENT INS \$1031.49 CORRECTIONS OFFICER  
RET PLAN \$15580.96 EORP LEGACY \$5475.60 NATIONWIDE \$4803.61 NATIONWIDE  
RETIREMENT SOL EODCRS \$1429.92 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$2454.95 PUBLIC  
SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$12141.04 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET \$13879.12  
SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$1188.91 VANESSA LENA JIM \$1610.02  
LAMUEL KEE WILLIAMS \$1610.02 DERRICK YAZZIE \$1610.02 Specific details of the  
demands may be requested through the County public record request process. B. Request  
approval of minutes dated February 3, 2026. C. Community Development: Discussion and  
possible approval to accept a Public Road Easement Agreement between Apache County and the

United States Forest Service for portions of County Road 2104, 2117, 2058 and related connector segments located within the Apache-Sitgreaves National Forest in the Alpine area, as described in Exhibits A, B, and C. The easement formalizes and supplements existing access rights, authorizing the county to construct, operate, and maintain these public roadways across National Forest lands. D. Recorder: Discussion and possible approval for the contract renewal with Runbeck Election Services. E. Economic Development: Discussion and possible approval of a letter of support to the Arizona Corporation Commission in support of SRP's conversions to natural gas. F. Treasurer: Discussion and possible approval to remove the Accounting Specialist III (Range 30) and the Back Tax Assistant III (Range 30) and to add an Administrative Assistant II (Range 30) and a Client Service Representative II (Range 26). This will not increase the FY26 budget. Vote was unanimous or Consent Agenda items A-F.

Mr. Patterson presented the item for a liquor license application recommendation for Sanjay Patel, the Chieftain Mobil, located at I-40 and Highway 191, Exit 333 in Chambers, Arizona. Mr. Patterson stated his office has received several protests regarding the application including seven protests from individuals living within a one-mile radius of the location and six chapters and other organizations who have sent in resolutions and letters of opposition including a petition with 905 signatures from community members who are against granting the license. Mr. Patterson stated he was also provided with incident statistics and island map of the location. Chairman Shepherd opened the floor for anyone wanting to comment on this item and limited the time for each speaker to two minutes.

Michael Costigon, a resident of Sanders, Arizona addressed the Board in opposition to the approval of the liquor license recommendation. Mr. Costigon stated while he was at the podium he wanted to address the Puerco Valley Fire Department's 3-million-dollar debt and they are blaming the county but he did research and he is aware that the fire district is overdrawing their account and if the county can help in any way he would appreciate it since he does not want to see fire and ambulance services go away.

Mary Tom, a resident of Chambers, Arizona stated she opposes the liquor license since the community does not need any additional liquor or drugs.

Shirley Nez, a resident of Sanders, Arizona voiced her opposition to the granting of the liquor license recommendation.

Julia Konheiser, a resident of Chambers, Arizona addressed the Board and stated she resides within a one-mile radius of the Chieftain Mobil in Chambers and she stated she strongly opposes the liquor license.

Maureen Woodman, a resident of Sanders, Arizona stated she is in opposition to the liquor license because she has seen devastation firsthand from the use of alcohol.

Reverend John Stratton, a resident of Chambers, Arizona stated he lives within a one-mile radius of Chieftain Mobil and is opposed to the liquor license being approved.

Kyle Lewis, a resident of Ft. Defiance representing the Ft. Defiance Veteran's Organization and presented a resolution opposing the liquor license from 26 chapters.

Martha Nez, a resident of Sanders, Arizona stated she opposes the liquor license due to the long term deterioration that alcohol causes.

Sherman Yazzie, a resident of Lupton, Arizona and a chapter president, and on behalf of Arbin Mitchell, a Navajo Nation Council Delegate, requested the Board oppose the liquor license Recommendation.

Ina Noggle, a resident of Sander, Arizona stated she opposed the liquor license application since the location is an island, surrounded by Navajo Nation, so no alcohol sales should be permitted and the lack by the Liquor department to safeguard the community of Sanders and Chambers due to the lack of routine inspections of liquor establishments and this item comes to a state hearing, she requested the board's testimony and advocacy at the hearing.

Ellen Romero, a resident of Sanders, Arizona stated she s opposed to the granting of the liquor license recommendation.

Ronald Daw, a resident of Sanders, Arizona and a Commander for the Houck Veteran's organization presented a resolution to the Board in opposition of the Liquor license application recommendation and stated as a retired police officer, he has seen the result of alcohol use.

Jackie Yazzie, Jr. a resident of Lupton, Arizona, the President of the Sanders Unified School Board stated he is opposed to the liquor license application.

Laura Lee Yazzie, a resident of Lupton, Arizona stated she is opposed to the granting of the liquor license application.

Verna Mae Tabaha, a resident of Sander's Arizona, stated she is opposed to the liquor license application.

Lillie Roanhouse, a resident of Window Rock, Arizona and the Wide Ruins Chapter Vice President stated her chapter passed a resolution opposing the liquor license application for the Mobil in Chambers.

Lois Watts, a resident of Sanders, Arizona stated she does not want alcohol in her community and is opposed to approving the liquor license.

Raymond Smith, Jr., a resident of Window Rock, Arizona stated his community is currently free of alcohol and he wants to see that continue and submitted a resolution from the veterans organization in opposition to the liquor license.

Nancy Roanhorse, a resident of Sanders, Arizona expressed her opposition to the liquor license in her community.

David Mancibaiz, a resident and pastor in Chambers, Arizona living within a half mile of the proposed liquor license establishment stated he is opposed to the granting of the liquor license.

James Watchman, Jr., Houck Chapter President and resident of Sanders, Arizona stated he is strongly opposed to the granting of the liquor license.

Darryl Ahasteen, a resident of Sanders, Arizona stated he is opposed to a liquor establishment in the Sanders area.

Linda Nelson, A resident of Window Rock, Arizona read a letter from the President of the Navajo Nation urging the Board to not approve the liquor license recommendation.

Yvonne Murphy, a resident of Lupton, Arizona requested the Board not approve the liquor license.

**Mr. Shirley moved to disapprove the liquor license application recommendation for Sanjay Patel for the Chieftain Mobil, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Mr. Davis thanked everyone who traveled for the board meeting to hear their input. Mr. Davis stated he is a 6<sup>th</sup> generation resident of Apache County and over the years he has reason to travel to the Sanders and Chambers areas and he is well aware of the history and he understands the deaths related to alcohol and is proud to have fought against this, and life is better without liquor being sold at this location; it is a island within the Navajo Nation and when you look at the statistics of how much better the community is since the liquor establishments closed, he is happy to stand with the community in support against this recommendation. Vote was unanimous to disapprove the liquor license recommendation.

Mr. Patterson requested approval of the purchase of 40.93-acre property identified as Parcel Number 202-27-012 and the assignment and assumption of the Mining Plan of Operations AZA-027449 covering 312.94 acres in the sum of up to \$40,000.00. Mr. Patterson stated this is for the limestone pit and will allow us to continue to mine for limestone for the roads. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Joseph Langkilde, Finance Director, requested ratification of an agreement with Walker & Armstrong for professional services related to reconciliation of Treasurer's accounts for FY2023, not to exceed \$50,000.00. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Jesse Thomas, on behalf of Emergency Management, requested approval to accept a \$25,000 grant award from the Salt River Project (SRP) Utilities Grant Funding Program to fund grant writing services for Apache County Emergency Management and no County General Fund match is required. Mr. Thomas again introduced Hank Hamblin, SRP Plant Manager and thanked him for the donation. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Steve Kizer, IT Director, requested approval of the IntelliComm Software as a Service Agreement between the Association of Public-Safety Communications Officials International and the Apache County Sheriff's Office for use of cloud-based software to aid in providing dispatching services. Mr. Kizer stated this agreement is effective March 3, 2026, and is subject for annual renewal. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Steve Kizer, IT Director, requested approval of the purchasing of radio equipment and installation from Niles Radio Communications for Dispatch in the amount of \$124,359.17. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Chief Deputy Sheriff Roscoe Herrera, requested approval of the Goserco recording system for the Sheriff's Office, used by Dispatch, Patrol, and Detention for communications recordings, evidence and documentation. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson presented notification of the following meetings where two or more members of the Apache County Board of Supervisors may be in attendance:

- The Eastern Arizona Counties Organization meeting on March 18, 2026, at 3:30 p.m. held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.
- Small Counties Forum meeting on March 18, 2026, at 5:30 p.m. held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.
- The County Supervisors Association (CSA) meeting on March 19, 2026, at 10:00 a.m. held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, Arizona.

No action was needed or taken.

Chairman Shepherd opened the floor for call to the public and limited the time for each speaker to three minutes.

Mark Ostermann, a resident of Vernon, Arizona requested proposed changes to the renewable energy ordinance and stated there isn't any real protection for the county and asked for moratorium on renewable energy until those changes are made to the ordinance.

Glenn Rogers, a resident of Eagar, Arizona and is opposed to windmills in the county and outlined the issues and problems associated with wind energy and is a big mistake to allow wind energy in Apache County.

Monica Boehning, a resident of Springerville, Arizona, thanked county officials who traveled to Phoenix on February 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Lava Run Interconnection Project hearing and Thanked Mr. Davis for his letters defending the county's jurisdictional authority over the project.

Susan Maxwell, a resident of Vernon, commented on the proposed Blackridge and Lava Run project construction will negatively impact the aquifer and vegetation.

Lonnie Randall, a resident of Concho, spoke about wind speeds necessary for wind turbines to run efficiently with only 2 months out of the year wind speeds are in the optimal range and the amount of water necessary for the concrete will negatively impact the aquifer and once the turbine is decommissioned; reclamation cannot ever be achieved.

Jennene Randall, a resident of Concho, stated she is opposed to the proposed wind and solar farms in the county and urged the Board to stop wind and solar ecocides in Apache County.

Bill Miketta, a resident of Vernon, expressed his concerns as a real estate agent regarding wind turbine farms under consideration and how approving the wind farms will negatively impact property values.

Tyler Stein, policy analyst with Rural Arizona Action, Casa Grande, Arizona, requested the County move to a vote center model for 2026 election. Mr. Stein outlined the benefits of vote centers. Mr. Stein also asked the Board to take an official position against HCR2016 which is a bill that would ban voting centers and eliminate all early voting in the state.

Lorraine Vaught, a resident of Vernon, stated she is concerned with the proposed wind farms projects that will negatively affect the health and welfare of the community and its residents.

Peggy Minor, a resident of Concho, stated the wind farm projects are a complex issue with a number of factors and is concerned that a choice will be made without proper independent information like hydrology and the costs pertaining to decommissioning the turbines and affirm our rural way of life.

Wink Krigler, a resident of Springerville, stated she is a four-generation family member of agriculturist and land stewards and urged the Board to listen to the land and asked the Board to deny the opportunity for the wind turbines in the county.

Mark Odenbach, a resident of Vernon, expressed his opposition to wind turbines and urged support of natural gas and nuclear generation stations.

Donald Maxwell, a resident of Vernon, outlined his reasons for opposing any wind and solar projects in the county.

Jennifer Bjordahl, a resident of Vernon, stated that everyone here today seems opposed to wind Turbines and stated she is concerned that the energy generated is going to Tucson, Phoenix and California so we get all the use of our resources, and they get the benefits of power as well as the fire issues the turbines will bring to the area and asked the Board to fight bringing in wind energy.

Kimberly Autrey stated she is a new resident of Concho and is a proponent of preserving the beautiful vast open lands and voiced her reasons to strongly oppose the Black Ridge and Lava Run projects.

There was no one else wanting to address the Board during call to the public.

**Mr. Shirley moved to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Approved this 7<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2026.

/s/ Alton Joe Shepherd  
Chairman of the Board

/s/ Ryan N. Patterson  
Clerk of the Board