

OFFICIAL PROCEEDINGS OF THE APACHE COUNTY
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS MEETING

June 4, 2024
St. Johns, Arizona

Present were, Chairman Joe Shirley, Jr., Vice Chairman Alton Joe Shepherd and Supervisor Nelson Davis. Also present was Clerk of the Board/County Manager Ryan N. Patterson, County Attorney Michael Whiting and Chief Deputy County Attorney Celeste Robertson.

Chairman Shirley called to order the Board of Supervisors meeting at 8:30 a.m. in the Board of Supervisors' chambers, County Annex Building, 75 West Cleveland Street, St. Johns, Arizona, and welcomed all in attendance.

Preston Raban gave the invocation.

Matt Fish led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Shirley called for the Health District item.

Kimberly Cole, Health Director, requested approval of a contract with RW Billboard Advertising. The Tobacco Prevention Program grant is funding this expense to advertise the ASHLINE program. **Mr. Davis moved to approve, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Shepherd moved to adjourn the Health District meeting, seconded by Mr. Davis. Vote was unanimous.

Chairman Shirley called for the regular agenda items.

Timothy Hinton, Finance Director presented the item following a public hearing, discussion and possible approval of the Truth in Taxation notification of the primary property tax levy as presented, with tax rates to be set at the August 19, 2024, Board of Supervisors meeting. **Mr. Shepherd moved to open the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous. There was no one wanting to address the Board during the public hearing. **Mr. Davis moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous. Mr. Hinton stated currently the tax is \$69.00 based on a \$100,000 home, and the proposed tax will go to \$71.71 on a \$100,000 home. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Timothy Hinton, Finance Director, presented the item for the Board sitting as the Board of Directors and following a public hearing, discussion, and possible approval of the 2024-2025 Final Budgets for the Apache County Library District, Apache County Public Health Services District, Apache County Flood Control District, Apache County Juvenile Jail District, Apache County Jail District, Junior College Tuition and the Post-Secondary Education. A copy of the proposed budgets are available online at www.apachecountyaz.gov or in the County Manager's Office. **Mr. Shepherd moved to open the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was

unanimous. There was no one wanting to address the Board during the public hearing. **Mr. Shepherd moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous. **Mr. Shepherd moved to approve the final budget for the special districts, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

The Board sat as the Board of Supervisors and following a public hearing, discussion and possible adoption of the 2024-2025 Final Budget for Apache County. **Mr. Davis moved to open the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous. Marleita Begay, County Treasurer, asked if there were going to be COLA raises given to the employees. Mr. Patterson stated the proposed budget includes a 3% increase for employees. **Mr. Davis moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous. Mr. Davis thanked Mr. Hinton, Mr. Patterson and the elected officials and department heads for their work on the budget. **Mr. Shepherd moved to approve the final budget, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson presented the Consent Agenda items A-J and recommended approval. **Mr. Shepherd moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Mr. County Manager/Clerk of the Board:
A. Request approval of demands as distributed to the Apache County Board of Supervisors between May 7, 2024, to June 4, 2024. Demands are payments made, or to be made, by the County. Payee Amount AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$1350.59 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES \$4337.22 ADVANCED AIR SYSTEMS LLC \$1125.00 ALLEGRA \$1064.86 ALSCO INC \$1260.08 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$3777.10 ARDURRA (FORMERLY WOODSON ENGINEERING & SURVEYING) \$12300.00 AZ SUPREME COURT \$2232.27 B&R TRUCKING \$2070.00 BACKWOODS TEES \$3039.80 BISON TRAILS EMBROIDERY \$1512.00 BOB BARKER COMPANY INC \$2897.27 BURNHAM – IFP LLC \$1000.00 CDW GOVERNMENT LLC \$4137.81 COALITION OF ARIZONA NEW MEXICO COUNTIES \$2600.00 COLL CONSULTING LLC \$13730.00 CONTRACT PHARMACY SERVICES INC \$24599.45 DH PACE COMPANY INC \$1564.00 DOYLES AUTO BODY INC \$4731.31 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$3429.11 EMPIRE POWER SYSTEMS AND EMPIRE SOUTHWEST LLC \$1144.07 FRONTIER \$1672.54 HS GOVTECH USA INC \$2400.00 HUNTER GUARD RAIL AND FENCE INC \$4996.10 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES \$2680.52 KARPEL COMPUTER SYSTEMS INC \$6873.30 KUBL GROUP LLC \$16900.00 LAW OFFICE OF MICHAEL S PENROD PLC \$6792.00 LESUEUR ADVANCE AUTOMOTIVE LLC \$4030.03 MCCOOK BOILER AND PUMP COMPANY \$7593.36 MH CONSULTING & PROJECT MANAGEMENT LLC \$1853.60 NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR JAIL OPERATIONS \$1700.00 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY \$3877.30 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$3769.98 NTUA WIRELESS, LLC \$5220.02 PERFECT PRINTZ LLC \$1804.50 QUILL CORP \$2090.24 RUNBECK ELECTION SERVICES INC \$8357.53 SARATOGA RACK MARKETING LLC \$24197.34 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$2631.61 SILVER CREEK MORTUARY LLC (TAYLOR AZ) \$2086.30 ST JOHNS EMERGENCY SERVICES \$1474.87 TRAFFIC & PARKING CONTROL CO INC \$1944.16 UMB Bank N.A \$1000.00 US POSTMASTER \$1250.00 VERIZON WIRELESS \$1215.25 BENJAMIN SLATON JOHNSTON \$1835.00 WILLIAM WADE WILTBANK \$1034.18 JAY YELLOWHORSE \$1185.75 PERKINS CINDERS INC \$18059.90 NATIONAL BANK \$28768.66 NATIONAL BANK OF ARIZONA 3040 \$2074.15 ADVANCED AIR SYSTEMS LLC \$2550.00 ALL MOUNTAIN RV SERVICE & SUPPLY

\$2344.97 ALLEGRA \$7736.94 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$4572.06 APACHE COUNTY 4-H LEADERS COUNCIL \$1000.00 APACHE NATURAL RESOURCES CONSERVATION DISTRICT \$5000.00 B&R TRUCKING \$5520.00 BAUMAN HOME AND AUTO INC (CARQUEST) \$1102.48 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$21243.08 BREWER LAW OFFICE PLLC \$10500.00 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$1491.00 John Lucas COMMUNITY BROADBAND ADVOCATES LLC \$8362.50 CRESCENT ELECTRIC SUPPLY CO \$1062.07 DESERT MOUNTAIN CORPORATION \$6854.93 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$18035.91 EMPIRE POWER SYSTEMS AND EMPIRE SOUTHWEST LLC \$67700.50 EVENFLO COMPANY INC \$1584.59 FRONTIER \$4208.59 HAMBLIN LAW OFFICE PLC \$10500.00 KLINT HEAP \$1407.84 ROBERT JAMES HIGGINS \$2072.15 HILLYARD/ FLAGSTAFF \$1121.97 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES \$1159.56 LAWSON PRODUCTS INC \$3134.09 MULTICARD \$2907.00 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$1410.34 OVERDRIVE INC \$1489.12 PACIFIC PONDEROSA CO INC \$3432.58 DANA BRYCE PATTERSON \$10500.00 PUBLIC AGENCY TRAINING COUNCIL INC \$1190.00 QUALITY CARQUEST \$3083.32 QUILL CORP \$2241.74 R JOHN R JOHN LEE ATTORNEY AT LAW \$10500.00 RDO EQUIPMENT CO \$4384.29 RELIABLE BACKGROUND SCREENING \$1045.00 RHINEHART OIL CO \$7539.29 RUSH TRUCK CENTER \$21970.97 SALT RIVER PROJECT - SRP – MARS \$1091.00 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$1640.84 SUMMIT FUNERAL HOME \$3942.64 SUMMIT HEALTHCARE ASSOCIATION INC \$6702.75 SUTTON WEED & PEST CONTROL \$1625.00 THE AARONS COMPANY LLC \$3000.00 THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA \$7500.00 THOMSON REUTERS WEST \$1418.05 TRUCK PRO DBA AZ BRAKE & CLUTCH SUPPLY \$1036.32 WOODLAND BUILDING CENTER C/O NATIONS BEST \$1359.06 APACHE COUNTY HSA \$6546.89 APACHE COUNTY MEDICAL \$202642.21 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$177597.09 ASRS LEGACY EORP \$11467.76 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM \$142533.34 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET PLAN \$14326.50 EORP LEGACY \$3039.91 NATIONWIDE \$4591.80 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$3260.18 PUBLIC SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$15436.78 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET \$11073.82 SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$2394.87 JESSE THOMAS \$2105.38 ADHS AZ HEALTH CARE COST \$44800.00 ADVANCED CORRECTIONAL HEALTHCARE INC \$1624.12 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$3377.53 AUTOMATICS & MORE INC \$1541.99 AZ COUNTIES INSURANCE POOL \$10860.15 B&R TRUCKING \$4140.00 BLUE HILLS ENVIRONMENTAL \$1896.01 BOB BARKER COMPANY INC \$1365.71 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$23721.95 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$2000.00 CBT NUGGETS LLC \$1307.02 CHARM-TEX \$3588.00 CONTINUANT INC \$1385.22 CONTRACT PHARMACY SERVICES INC \$20423.08 CREDITRON CORPORATION \$6681.41 DELL COMPUTER CORPORATION \$4640.35 DESERT MOUNTAIN CORPORATION \$29145.07 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$2390.31 HIGH DESERT TRAILER SALES OF AZ INC \$4740.66 HILLYARD/FLAGSTAFF \$1079.21 INLAND KENWORTH INC (FARMINGTON) \$1299.52 KUHLMAN PSYCHOLOGY & CONSULTING PLLC \$1500.00 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY \$3035.86 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$8765.36 NFOCUS SOLUTIONS \$1947.00 NORTHERN ARIZONA COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENT – NACOG \$17682.00 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$2076.08 PACIFIC PONDEROSA CO INC \$14913.25 PIMA COUNTY MEDICAL \$16000.00 QUILL CORP \$1425.12 RIM OUTDOOR SOLUTIONS \$62171.08 SAFELITE AUTO GLASS \$1390.08 SARATOGA RACK MARKETING LLC \$41009.40 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$1798.81 SIERRA

PROPANE \$1686.74 SKAGGS PUBLIC SAFETY UNIFORMS & EQUIPMENT \$2913.40
VICTIMS COMP \$3777.71 ST JOHNS CITY \$2101.75 THOMSON REUTERS WEST
\$1709.74 TRINITY SERVICES GROUP INC \$23674.33 VICTIMS COMP \$3990.09
VERIZON WIRELESS \$1192.43 WHITE MOUNTAIN HEATING AND COOLING \$1000.00
WHITE MOUNTAIN REGIONAL MEDICAL CENTER \$1066.52 WRIGHT EXPRESS FSC
WEX \$3347.16 MARLEITA BEGAY \$1021.16 SAMUEL A WOOD \$1374.17 ANDREWS
REFRIGERATION INC \$1218.15 ADVANCED AIR SYSTEMS LLC \$1312.50 ALERTUS
TECHNOLOGIES LLC \$5165.00 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$12209.02 AMIGO
CHRYSLER DODGE JEEP RAM \$5063.14 ARIZONA LOCAL HEALTH OFFICERS
ORGANIZATION \$1300.00 ASHTONS REPAIR INC \$1436.68 AT&T MOBILITY LLC
(FIRSTNET) \$3050.55 AXON ENTERPRISE INC \$4427.76 AZLGEBT \$403016.17 B&R
TRUCKING \$8280.00 BAUMAN HOME AND AUTO INC (CARQUEST) \$1291.94 BRAD
HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$23931.78 CHANGEPOINT INTEGRATED HEALTH \$7200.00
COURTESY CHEVROLET \$49967.55 CULLIGAN - PHOENIX \$3915.55 DESERT
MOUNTAIN CORPORATION \$16653.01 DISCOUNT TIRE \$1855.66 EMPIRE
MACHINERY \$3621.64 FRONTIER \$4206.07 GLAXO SMITHKLINE PHARMACY
\$1963.77 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES \$2236.42 LESUEUR ADVANCE AUTOMOTIVE
LLC \$10276.42 MANAGED PRINT SERVICES INC \$1900.00 MEAD PUBLISHING
\$2500.00 NATIONAL PEN CO LLC \$1331.39 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY
\$2791.13 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$12360.33 OVERDRIVE INC
\$3111.87 PACIFIC PONDEROSA CO INC \$24966.59 PINAL COUNTY ARIZONA
\$6246.00 POWERSCREEN OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA INC \$7900.00 QUALITY
CARQUEST \$1715.28 QUILL CORP \$2496.21 REDW LLC \$47742.00 RHINEHART OIL CO
\$1293.22 SCORPION HARLEY DAVIDSON \$1504.67 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC
\$1703.98 SIERRA PROPANE \$1149.88 ST JOHNS EMERGENCY SERVICES \$1232.88
TREAD MASTERS TIRE & LUBE \$1548.40 VERIZON WIRELESS \$3156.47 APACHE
COUNTY HSA \$6546.89 APACHE COUNTY MEDICAL \$202848.40 APACHE COUNTY
TAX WITHHOLDING \$178948.46 ASRS LEGACY EORP \$11467.76 AZ STATE
RETIREMENT SYSTEM \$141352.09 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET PLAN \$14284.29
EORP LEGACY \$3039.91 NATIONWIDE \$4767.02 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$4435.18
PUBLIC SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$15436.78 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET
\$11037.25 SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$1940.00 KEIRSTEN NIELSEN
\$6300.00 ERICA NOVAK \$1133.99 NAVAJO NATION \$90000.00 USDA FOREST
SERVICE SPRINGVILLE RANGER DIST \$1500.00 Specific details of the demands may be
requested through the County public record request process. B. Request approval of minutes
dated May 7, 2024. C. Request approval of the waiver of tax exemption for Gary Christofferson,
parcel102-37-003B pursuant to ARS §42-11153. The disability exemption was filed late
due to illness. D. Request approval of the waiver of tax exemption for Betty Slaughter, parcel
106-61-023 pursuant to ARS §42-11153. The widow's exemption was filed late due to illness. E.
Request approval of the waiver of tax exemption for Melissa & Maurin Valentine, parcel 203-
84-136 pursuant to ARS §42-11153. The disability exemption was filed late due to illness. F.
District II: Request approval to enter into an Intergovernmental Agreement with the Nazlini
Chapter. Community Development: G. Request approval of a Conditional Use Permit allowing
Roy Thomas Elam to construct and operate a storage unit facility consisting of 103 units and
allowing a decrease in the required setbacks on the south and west side of the lot. The
property is located off highway 61 and County Road 5050 in Concho, AZ, parcel 201-30-

005D. The Apache County Planning & Zoning Commission recommended approval with conditions on May 2, 2024. Treasurer's Office: H. Request approval of "Certificate of Removal and Abatement of Taxes" pursuant to A.R.S. §42-18351. Total taxes, penalties, and interest to be abated in the amount of \$3,701.99 for M8700256. Human Resources: I. Request approval of the Apache County Human Resources Policy Manual Section 7.7 Cellular Phone Policy. J. Assessor's Office: Request authorization to create a Property Appraiser I position (Range 31) effective July 1, 2024. Vote was unanimous for Consent Agenda items A-J.

Danee Roan, on behalf of the Recorder's Office, requested approval of an agreement with Runbeck for national change of address services. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Paul Hancock, Probation Services Director, requested approval of a grant from the Administrative Office of the Courts to improve supervision and rehabilitation services and the total amount of the grant is \$17,185. **Mr. Shepherd moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Paul Hancock, Probation Services Director requested approval of a Drug, Gang and Violent Crime Control Program grant in the amount of \$28,113 with Apache County Adult Probation Division providing \$3,092 in matching funds, and \$6,279 in in-kind funds, for a total of amount of \$37,484. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Paul Hancock, Probation Services Director, requested approval to appoint Timothy Hinton, Director of Finance, as the Chief Fiscal Officer for both Adult and Juvenile divisions in accordance with A.R.S. §12-268A and the Arizona Code of Judicial Administration, Part 6, Sections 6-206 and 6-301. **Mr. Shepherd moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Rita Vaughn, Election Director requested approval to cancel the election for the Libertarian Precinct Committeemen and appoint the candidates who filed nomination petitions to fill the positions for the upcoming July 30, 2024 Primary Election. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Rita Vaughn, Election Director, requested approval to cancel the election for the Democratic Precinct Committeemen and appoint the candidates who filed nomination petitions to fill the positions for the upcoming July 30, 2024 Primary Election. **Mr. Shepherd moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.**

Rita Vaughn, Election Director, requested approval due to cancellation of the Republican Precinct Committeemen Election on July 30, 2024, to appoint Earl Cochran who filed a nomination petition to fill the position of Republic Precinct committeemen for the Eagar Precinct. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Rita Vaughn, Election Director, requested approval of the designated polling locations for the upcoming July 30, 2024, Primary Election. **Mr. Shepherd moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.**

Timothy Hinton, Finance Director, requested approval of a Consent Order between Apache County and the Arizona Department of Environmental Quality. **Mr. Davis moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson requested approval of Amendments and Declaration of Trust of the Arizona Local Government Employee Benefit Trust. **Mr. Shepherd moved approval, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous.

Chairman Shirley opened the floor for the call to the public.

Louisa Quintana, a resident of Eagar, expressed her opposition to any future proposed wind farm.

Brian Carpenter, a resident of Springerville, spoke against any proposed wind farm.

Tera Davis, a resident of Springerville, Arizona spoke against any future proposed wind farm and requested the Board of Supervisors place an item on the next agenda to stop Lava Run.

Monica Boehning, a resident of Springerville, stated she is opposed to Lava Run Wind Farm.

Lyman Murdock, a resident of Eagar, expressed his opposition to any future proposed wind farm.

Joseph Lamoureux, a resident of St. Johns, stated he was opposed to any future wind farm in Apache County.

Lloyd Johnson a resident of Holbrook, stated he is a Arizona State Representative candidate and is opposed to any proposed future wind farm.

Paul Reed, a resident of Vernon, stated he is opposed to Lava Run, a future proposed wind farm.

There was no one else wanting to address the Board during the call to the public.

Mr. Shepherd moved to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Mr. Davis. Vote was unanimous.

Approved this 2nd day of July, 2024.

/s/ Dr. Joe Shirley, Jr.
Chairman of the Board

/s/ Ryan N. Patterson
Clerk of the Board