

OFFICIAL PROCEEDINGS OF THE APACHE COUNTY  
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS' MEETING

December 2, 2025

St. Johns, Arizona

Present were, Chairman Nelson Davis and Vice Chairman Joe Shirley, Jr. Also present, Ryan Patterson Clerk of the Board/Manager and Chief Deputy County Attorney Chris Resare. Supervisor Alton Joe Shepherd participated via the telephone.

Chairman Davis called to order the Board of Supervisors meeting at 8:30 a.m. in the Board of Supervisors' chambers, County Annex Building, 75 West Cleveland Street, St. Johns, Arizona and welcomed all in attendance.

Matt Fish gave the invocation.

J.J. Thomas led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Davis called for the Jail District item.

Commander Notah on behalf of the Jail District, requested approval of the renewal agreement with the Tohono O'odham Nation for inmate housing and detention services. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

**Mr. Shirley moved to adjourn the Jail District meeting, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Chairman Davis called for the regular agenda items.

Matt Fish, Community Development Director, presented the item following a public hearing, discussion Request approval of a Conditional Use Permit for Juniper Spring Solar, LLC allowing EDF Power Solutions, LLC to develop a 500-megawatt solar and battery storage facility on Arizona State Trust land east of the Springerville Generating Station. Gen-tie crosses APN 108-44-001A and 108-45-001 and the Planning & Zoning Commission unanimously recommended approval October 2, 2025. **Mr. Shirley moved to open the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Rich Nichols, a property owner in Apache County stated he has property near the proposed project and stated he is pro green energy but has concerns with the parent company that has a history of violating court orders when they have been in violation. Mr. Nichols stated he is also concerned with battery storage and when lithium batteries catch fire, they let them burn since there is no way to put them out and if that happens, within two miles of ground zero, all the soil is completely unusable and that is within the area where he is living. Mr. Nichols stated he scope with someone with Juniper Springs and they do have a reclamation bond, but he is concerned with the residents that will be impacted by this project. Mr. Nichols asked the Board of Supervisors to not approve this project.

Monica Boehning, a resident of Springerville, thanks the Board of Supervisors for delaying the vote last month since there were additional provisions and conditions that were lacking and hoped additional conditions could be added since the Board of Supervisors has the authority to add additional conditions to make this a complete permit. Ms. Boehning stated the county policy that only providing supplemental materials prior to the vote 24 hours on the county website, does not allow the citizens time to review, making it difficult to get those corrected before the meeting.

Sam Wood, a resident of Apache County addressed the Board and stated coal power is going away and the option remains of what to do as an alternative and there are only two choices; wind or solar and he just drive to Alabama and saw endless miles of wind turbines and they are hideous and are a terrible system and don't do what they promise. Mr. Wood stated he uses solar panels and they are a reliable and efficient way to generate energy. Mr. Wood stated there is a problem with batteries, but they are being improved every year. Mr. Wood stated bringing in alternative energy is a way to provide jobs for the area and bring in good tax revenue.

Twila Hall, a resident of St. Johns, stated we live by two massive power plants but St. Johns, doesn't get power from either one. Ms. Hall asked if the batteries that will be used are secured so they don't get wet because they will catch fire if they get wet and will there be someone to monitor if there is a fire. Ms. Hall asked if the communities of St. Johns, and Round Valley going to get any of the power from the solar farm or shipped away like SRP and TEP do. Ms. Hall asked if property taxes are going to go up because of this project.

Jon Gillespie, an attorney with the Rose Law Group, representing the EDF Power Solutions solar Project, and he has been in attendance with the multiple public hearings with the Planning & Zoning Commission and are proud of the job his company has done with this project to address all the aspects that make Apache County so wonderful. Mr. Gillespie stated this project will generate significant property tax and create jobs that will significantly impact the area. Mr. Gillespie stated significant work has been done with the ranching community, neighbors and fire district including a 600-foot buffer put between the property owners to the west that was done as specific coordination with the plans that were submitted.

Donna Kilpatrick, a resident of St. Johns, submitted a petition with 339 signatures in support of the Juniper Spring project. Ms. Kilpatrick stated she is happy that this project will bring in jobs and revenue but is concerned where the power will be going.

There was no one else wanting to address the Board during the public hearing. Chairman Davis thanked Matt Fish and his staff for the work they did to bring this project before the Board. Mr. Shirley asked about additions or deletions to the permit. Mr. Resare stated it can be changed typically only by agreement of all parties. **Mr. Shirley moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Vote was unanimous. Mr. Fish stated in response to Mr. Shirley's question, the conditions are written in a manner that a final building and grading permit will not be issued to the applicant until everything has been taken care of so with that said, he recommended adding a 9<sup>th</sup> condition that prior to approval of the final development plan, the applicant shall coordinate with the Apache Natural Resources Conservation District and address applicable recommendations and best management practices with the final project design and

construction plans to the extent feasible. Mr. Davis stated he was under the impression that on almost all of our conditional use permits we have a 1-5 year reclamation bond that we evaluate every five years and asked if that was in the paperwork. Mr. Fish stated that it was in the current ordinance. **Mr. Shirley stated with the coal power plant being shut down, there needs to be something to replace it, and this project is a good thing and moved to approve the permit and add the 9<sup>th</sup> condition as stated by Mr. Fish, seconded by Mr. Davis.** Mr. Shepherd thanked the six individuals who addressed the Board and stated we are facing the closure of the power plants and this will bring in revenue for the special districts such as the library, fire, health, Jr. Colleges and vocational training and with the projected revenue as well as the impact with construction and wages, he appreciates Juniper Springs and looks forward to update on the progress going towards 2030. Vote was unanimous.

Megan Hill, Election Director, presented the item following a public hearing, discussion and possible approval of a new election fee schedule. Mrs. Hill stated this is an increase since the fees haven't been updated since 2011 and will bring this current with other surrounding counties. **Mr. Shepherd moved to open the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous. There was no one wanting to address the Board during the public hearing. **Mr. Shirley moved to close the public hearing, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous. Mr. Shepherd asked when the rates would go into effect, and for an overview of the current and proposed rates. Mrs. Hill stated there is no election scheduled until the August primary so that will be the first time the new rates will be in effect. Mrs. Hill provided an overview of the current rate and the proposed rate. Mr. Davis asked if we are in line with other counties. Mrs. Hill stated this brings us in line with Navajo County and below Coconino County. Mr. Davis stated the proposed fee schedule is much easier to understand. **Mr. Shepherd moved to approve, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Chairman Davis presented the item to sit as the Board of Equalization to accept the following Petitions for Notice of Change Valuation determinations heard by Hearing Officer Charles Johnson:

- Acceptance of hearing determination for Michael Estes, Parcel 101-18-013H.
- Acceptance of hearing determination for John Bawden, Parcel 106-36-019M.
- Acceptance of hearing determination for S. Charles Fitts, Parcels 206-67-011A, 206-67-011B, 206-67-011C, 206-67-016A and 206-67-016B.
- Acceptance of hearing determination for Teresa Ann Dewer Trust, Parcel 106-05-003G.

**Mr. Shirley moved to accept Hearing Officer Johnson's determinations, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson presented the Consent Agenda items A-F and recommended approval. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** County Manager/Clerk of the Board: A. Request approval of demands as distributed to the Apache County Board of Supervisors between October 28, 2025 to November 20, 2025. Demands are payments made, or to be made, by the County. Payee Amount BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$1000.00 KUHLMAN PSYCHOLOGY &

CONSULTING PLLC \$1000.00 HILLYARD/FLAGSTAFF \$1001.62 AT&T MOBILITY LLC (FIRSTNET) \$1011.36 BAUMAN HOME AND AUTO INC \$1017.40 LARISSA LEE \$1027.10 COLONIAL LIFE AND ACCIDENT INS \$1030.96 COLONIAL LIFE AND ACCIDENT INS \$1030.96 MARLEITA BEGAY \$1035.19 OWENS LIVINGSTON MORTUARY \$1037.00 REAL TIME SOLUTIONS \$1038.05 GREER COMMUNITY FACILITIES \$1040.10 PERSONNEL SAFETY ENTERPRISES \$1047.70 WAGNER EQUIPMENT CO \$1062.46 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY \$1075.12 VIGILANCE PROJECT \$1100.00 EMPIRE POWER SYSTEMS AND EMPIRE SOUTHWEST LLC \$1108.48 HIGH COUNTRY PROPANE \$1177.81 ALSCO INC \$1181.31 SAMUEL A WOOD \$1185.10 SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$1188.91 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$1197.05 BO HOUNSHELL \$1200.00 NAPA \$1205.59 ALSCO INC \$1220.23 AMERICAN FIRE EQUIPMENT (HILLER) \$1260.00 INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION ASSESSING OFFICER IAAO \$1275.00 SUPPORT PAYMENT CLEARINGHOUSE \$1276.60 MH CONSULTING & PROJECT MANAGEMENT LLC \$1280.10 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$1313.10 MCCOOK BOILER AND PUMP COMPANY \$1320.15 WHITE MOUNTAIN REGIONAL MEDICAL CENTER \$1323.49 KLINT HEAP \$1340.01 OVERDRIVE INC \$1343.25 SAFE RESTRAINTS INC \$1347.12 NAVAJO TRIBAL UTILITY AUTHORITY \$1348.68 DOUGLAS LANCE PEARCE \$1350.30 FREEDOM PSYCHOLOGICAL CENTER \$1360.00 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$1384.07 MOUNTAIN ROOF REPAIR LLC \$1402.00 WOODLAND BUILDING CENTER C/O NATIONS BEST \$1432.69 NATIONWIDE RETIREMENT SOL EODCRS \$1484.93 NATIONWIDE RETIREMENT SOL EODCRS \$1484.93 QUILL CORP \$1505.86 QUILL CORP \$1562.19 BOB BARKER COMPANY INC \$1564.82 EMPIRE POWER SYSTEMS AND EMPIRE SOUTHWEST LLC \$1590.07 SPRINGVILLE AUTOMOTIVE SERVICE \$1597.36 BILLS MACHINE SHOP \$1640.67 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$1641.50 FLEET PRIDE \$1693.23 RELIABLE BACKGROUND SCREENING \$1702.04 ALLEGRA \$1776.50 RUSH TRUCK CENTER \$1812.24 APACHE COUNTY SHERIFF'S POSSE \$1875.00 COMMNET WIRELESS \$1900.00 SOUTHERN WATER SERVICE LLC \$1905.40 CLARK TRUCK EQUIPMENT COMPANY INC \$1965.00 EMPIRE MACHINERY \$1991.78 AZ DEPT OF RISK MANAGEMENT \$2008.55 EKOS \$2015.56 EBSCO SUBSCRIPTION SERVICES/ KWIKBOOST LLC \$2032.56 BLUE HILLS ENVIRONMENTAL \$2158.43 MH CONSULTING & PROJECT MANAGEMENT LLC \$2250.00 SECURUS TECHNOLOGIES INC \$2268.92 RIM COUNTRY MECHANICAL \$2309.18 MICHAEL PENROD \$2318.40 HS GOVTECH USA INC \$2400.00 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$2435.04 NATIONWIDE TRUST FSB \$2442.03 CENGAGE LEARNING INC \$2450.35 MALCOLM CHARLEY BOYD \$2500.00 PEAK FORENSIC PSYCHOLOGY \$2500.00 ST JOHNS CITY \$2564.04 GREEN MEADOWS FUNERAL HOME LLC \$2585.50 POLARIS PHARMACY SERVICES OF WARRINGTON LLC \$2587.80 QUILL CORP \$2651.99 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$2663.43 QUILL CORP \$2664.98 HILLYARD/FLAGSTAFF \$2734.66 NEWMAN SIGNS INC \$2776.06 SOCFORTRESS LLC \$2812.00 CORDANT HEALTH SOLUTIONS \$2940.01 SAFELITE AUTO GLASS \$2964.23 CANVA US INC \$3000.00 THE AARONS COMPANY LLC \$3000.00 NAVOPACHE ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$3027.30 INGRAM LIBRARY SERVICES \$3038.19 JOHNSON CONTROLS FIRE PROTECTION LP \$3119.56 THOMSON REUTERS WEST \$3233.62 CDW GOVERNMENT LLC \$3414.31 CASSEY RAE DREW \$3550.00 MCKESSON MEDICAL SURGICAL \$3655.60 O'REILLY AUTO PARTS \$3823.44 WHITE MOUNTAIN REGIONAL MEDICAL

CENTER \$3898.38 DOUBLETREE BY HILTON HOTEL FLAGSTAFF \$4000.00 John Lucas  
COMMUNITY BROADBAND ADVOCATES LLC \$4078.52 NATIONAL BANK OF  
ARIZONA 2172 \$4258.14 DENNISE L JONES \$4262.50 PHOENIX CHILDREN'S MEDICAL  
GROUP \$4424.00 RDO EQUIPMENT CO \$4528.41 NATIONWIDE \$4982.56 WRIGHT  
EXPRESS FSC WEX \$4988.40 FRONTIER \$4999.46 NTUA WIRELESS, LLC \$5220.02  
ARIZONA SHERIFF'S ASSOCIATION \$5250.00 NATIONWIDE \$5265.62 BEST TINTING  
AND AUTO GLASS \$5359.80 PREMIUM PROPANE LLC \$5489.57 MCCOOK BOILER  
AND PUMP COMPANY \$5497.97 EORP LEGACY \$5686.20 EORP LEGACY \$5686.20  
VERIZON WIRELESS \$5912.92 PACIFIC PONDEROSA CO INC \$5930.20 AT&T  
MOBILITY LLC (FIRSTNET) \$6017.09 MANGUM FAMILY TRUST C/O HOWARD  
MANGUM \$6020.04 BACKWOODS TEES \$6423.22 BURNHAM - IFP LLC \$6513.90  
RHINEHART OIL CO \$6660.38 THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA \$7000.00 APACHE  
COUNTY HSA \$7802.75 APACHE COUNTY HSA \$7802.75 AMAZON CAPITAL  
SERVICES INC \$7933.56 PERFECT PRINTZ LLC \$7993.44 CHAMPION FORD \$8119.17  
NORTHLAND PIONEER COLLEGE \$8209.36 LSQ GROUP HOLDINGS LLC \$8435.96  
AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$8630.31 WW CLYDE & CO \$9991.43 AMAZON  
CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$10242.41 BREWER LAW OFFICE PLLC \$10500.00 FLAKE  
LEGAL PLLC \$10500.00 HAMBLIN LAW OFFICE PLC \$10500.00 R JOHN R JOHN LEE  
ATTORNEY AT LAW \$10500.00 AMAZON CAPITAL SERVICES INC \$10545.00 ASRS  
LEGACY EORP \$12241.23 ASRS LEGACY EORP \$12241.23 PUBLIC SAFETY  
PERSONNEL 401 \$12443.66 PUBLIC SAFETY PERSONNEL 401 \$12443.66 DALE SHAWN  
TAYLOR \$12500.00 DANIEL TAYLOR \$12500.00 SANOFI PASTEUR INC \$12937.24 LSQ  
GROUP HOLDINGS LLC \$13163.62 LEXIPOL LLC \$13735.64 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF  
RET \$14623.14 PUBLIC SAFETY SHERIFF RET \$15058.99 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET  
PLAN \$15546.61 CORRECTIONS OFFICER RET PLAN \$15668.39 NAVOPACHE  
ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE \$15938.82 DESERT MOUNTAIN CORPORATION \$16864.25  
AZ COUNTIES INSURANCE POOL \$17328.29 TARTAN OIL LLC (FORMER NAME:  
SARATOGA) \$20548.94 BRAD HALL & ASSOCIATES INC \$22633.15 TRINITY  
SERVICES GROUP INC \$22963.34 NATIONAL BANK \$26922.98 REDW LLC \$34403.25  
TARTAN OIL LLC (FORMER NAME: SARATOGA) \$36913.56 ADVANCED  
CORRECTIONAL HEALTHCARE INC \$48530.42 ARIZONA ELEVATOR SOLUTIONS  
INC \$56537.43 COURTESY CHEVROLET \$60882.32 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM  
\$135573.76 AZ STATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM \$136851.01 CATERPILLAR FINANCIAL  
SERVICES CORPORATION \$137923.52 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING  
\$176313.40 APACHE COUNTY TAX WITHHOLDING \$176929.02 APACHE COUNTY  
MEDICAL \$217627.89 APACHE COUNTY MEDICAL \$222961.53 AZLGEBT \$422844.98  
AZLGEBT \$426904.01 Specific details of the demands may be requested through the County  
public record request process. B. Request approval of minutes dated November 4, 2025.

C. Request approval of the 2026 Board of Supervisors' meeting schedule. Community  
Development: D: Request approval of a Conditional Use Permit allowing Pinnacle Consulting,  
Representing Verizon Wireless to construct and operate a 185-foot monopole wireless  
communication tower and associated ground equipment on Assessor's Parcel Number (APN)  
101-35-011, located in Alpine, AZ. The Planning & Zoning Commission recommended approval  
November 6, 2025. Election Department: E. Request approval, based on the recommendation of  
Republican Party Chairman, Joseph Green, determine vacancies exist in the office of precinct  
committeeman and appoint Jeffrey Beecher for the Eagar precinct. Finance Department:

F. Request approval to allocate 5% of the 25% Payment (the Act of May 23, 1908) received in FY2025 to public roads and 95% to public schools. Vote was unanimous for Consent items A-F.

Mr. Patterson presented the item for the possible selection of the Board of Supervisors' Chairman for 2026. **Mr. Davis stated if Mr. Shepherd was willing to accept, motion to approve Alton Shepherd as the Chairman for 2026, seconded by Mr. Shirley.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson presented the item for the possible selection of the Board of Supervisors' Vice Chairman for 2026. **Mr. Davis moved to retain Dr. Joe Shirey as Vice Chairman for 2026, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous. Chairman Davis thanked the Board and staff for their assistance during his year as Chairman.

Mr. Patterson presented the item for discussion and possible approval of a liquor license application recommendation for Sheila Millette, Little Fork in the Road Café, located at 60 N. Main Street, Greer, Arizona. **Mr. Shirley moved approval, seconded by Mr. Shepherd.** Vote was unanimous.

Mr. Patterson presented notification of the following meetings where two or more members of The Apache County Board of Supervisors may be in attendance:

- The Eastern Arizona Counties Organization meeting on December 10, 2025, at 3:30 p.m. at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, AZ.
- Small Counties Forum meeting on December 10, 2025, at 5:30 p.m. held at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, AZ.
- The County Supervisors Association (CSA) meeting on December 11, 2025, at 10:00 a.m. at the County Supervisors Association building, 1905 W. Washington Street, Phoenix, AZ.

Chairman Davis opened the floor for call to the public.

Stan Zombrummen, a property owner adjacent to the proposed Verizon cell tower that was just approved. Mr. Zombrummen stated his biggest contention with it is the wear and tear on the private road that serves all the property owners and Mr. Fish assured him that his concern was addressed in Condition #5 of the Conditional Use Permit.

There was no one else wanting to address the board during call to the public.

**Mr. Shirley moved to adjourn the meeting, seconded by Mr. Shepherd. Vote was unanimous.**

Approved this 6<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2026.

/s/ Alton Joe Shepherd  
Chairman of the Board

/s/ Ryan N. Patterson  
Clerk of the Board